Report of Inquiry Tribunal

Incident at Minhaj-ul-Quran Academy and Secretariat in Model Town LAHORE

> Mr. Justice Ali Baqar Najafi (Tribunal of Inquiry)

Judge Lahore High Court, Lahore.

2014



In the Name of Allah, The Beneficent, The Merciful

CONTENTS

PAGE NO.

CHAPTER-1		o	0
	Introduction	0	- 01
	Efforts	o	₀ 05
	Positions	o	₀ 15
	Evidence of W	/itnesses: «	₀ 21
	Affidavits	o	₀ 46
Reports of Intelligence agencies			
	Facts revealed	d chronologically 。	53 <i>-6</i> 6
	Facts un-earth	o	61
	Manufacturing	/Production Record 。	35
	Sale/Administr	ration 。	36
CONC	LUSION	o	₀ 65
ORDE	R SHEET	o	75-128

INTRODUCTION

To broach the subject, it is necessary to mention some background which caused the proceedings of this Tribunal regarding the gory incident took place on 17.06.2014 at Minhaj-ul-Quran Academy and its Secretariat, 365-M, Model Town, Lahore and its surrounding vicinity causing firearm injuries and loss of lives which had created unrest in general public, attracting the attention of local and international media, therefore, in public interest, the Government of the Punjab in consultation with the Hon'ble Chief Justice, Lahore High Court, Lahore, appointed the undersigned as one man Tribunal of Inquiry under section 3 & 5 of the Punjab Tribunals of Inquiry Ordinance, 1969, vide Notification No.SO(Judl-III) 9-53/2014 dated 17.06.2014, for the purpose of a report regarding the incident grid the terms and reference of this Tribunal working as under:-

"For making inquiry and to ascertain the facts and circumstances of the incident at Minhaj-ul-Quran Academy and Secretariat in Model Town, Lahore."

(Annex-A).

Q 4/8/14 .

In the above said terms of reference, the additional powers under section 5 of the said Ordinance were conferred vide Notification of even number dated 19.06.2014, whereby this Tribunal was authorized to co-opt any expert or relevant person for the purpose of this inquiry. (Annex-B).

No.9/TOI dated 20.06.2014 this Tribunal Vide letter asked for conferment of additional powers u/s 11 of the Punjab Tribunals of Inquiry Ordinance, 1969 regarding the power of this Tribunal to order the police investigation into any matter coming before it sole for the purpose that work of tribunal may be under taken but the Govt. of the Punjab through letter No.SO (Judll.-III) 9-53/2014 dated 27.06.2014 refused to confer the power for the reason that FIR No.510/2014 under sections 302,34,324,353, 186l, 148, 149, 290, 291, 427, 506-B, 109 PPC read with section 7-ATA, 1997 and the process of investigation has already commenced under Chapter XIV of the Code of Criminal Procedure, 1908, read with the provisions of the Anti-Terrorism Act, 1997. (Annex-=C, C-1).



1

The Tribunal established its Secretariat and appointed staff to carry out its function, the detail is of which is given below:-

- 1. Mr. Jawad-ul-Hassan, D&SJ/Staff Officer to Hon'ble Chief Justice, as Registrar to the Tribunal.
- 2. Mr. Jamshed Akhtar Shaheen, Private Secretary/Incharge Complaint Cell, as Assistant to the Registrar.
- 3. Mr. Muhammad Din, Personal Assistant, as Staff Officer to the Tribunal.
- 4. Mr. Naveed Ahmad Hasahmi, Private Secretary, as Private Secretary to the Tribunal.
- 5. Mr. Ghulam Yasin, Private Secretary, as Additional Private Secretary to the Tribunal.
- 6. Mr. Shahzad Khalid, Personal Assistant as Additional Private Secretary to the Tribunal.
- 7. Mr. Javed Iqbal, Court Associate, as Custodian of record.
- 8. Syed Gulzar Hussain Anjum, Naib Qasid, as Naib Qasid to the Tribunal.
- 9. Muhammad Anwar, Stenographer, as Stenographer to the Tribunal.
- 10. Mr. Muhammad Azeem Badar, Naib Qasid, as Naib Qasid to the Tribunal.
- 11. Mr. Naseem Abbas Bhatti, Hardware Technician, as I.T Assistant.

However, Mr. Jawad-ul-Hassan, D&SJ/Staff Officer to Hon'ble Chief Justice, the Registrar of this Tribunal could not continue with this Tribunal by virtue of his transfer from Lahore High Court through notification of Govt. of Punjab and Lahore High Court, Lahore dated 29.06.2014 and 08.07.2014

respectively. Where-after Mr. Sadiq Masud Sabir, Additional District & Sessions Judge, Lahore was appointed as Registrar to the Tribunal. (Annex-D, D/1, D/2).

The Tribunal commenced its inquiry proceedings at Principal Seat in open. Upon the direction of this Tribunal on 19.106.2014 a notice was issued to general public inviting them for making submissions before tribunal. This public notice was issued in daily Dawn, the News, daily Nation, Business Recorder, daily Jang, daily Nawa-i-Waqt, daily Pakistan and Nai Baat. (Annex-E, & E/1 to E/8).

· .

An official Email address i.e. <u>tribunal.Minhajulquran</u> @gmail.com was also established on 21.06.2014. (Annex-E/9).

EFFORTS.

Right from the day one, open proceedings were conducted without releasing any media advice to make it participatory and transparent during which not only different points of view expressed but also valuable suggestions were given to guide this Tribunal for making effective efforts to dig out the truth by ascertaining the facts and circumstances of the incident under Inquiry, without investigating, fixing responsibility or making recommendations.

On 19.06.2014 the tribunal alongwith the Registrar visited the Secretariat of *Minhaj-ul-Quran* from inside and outside at about *Maghrib* time which lasted for 45 minutes.

On 20.06.2014 the Inspector General of Police/Provincial Police Officer, Punjab submitted the copies of the FIR No.510 dated 17.06.2014 under Section 302, 34, 324, 353, 186, 148, 149, 290, 291, 427, 506-B, 109 PPC read with ATA. (Annex F), a progress report by S.P. (Investigation), names of 11 police officers, names of 4 teams comprising of seven

members each, and names of police officers from 21 from 6 Ghazi Company, 20 from 1 Haider Company, 20 from Reserved, 10 from Tipu Company, 18 from QRF-1(Reserved-1), 19 from QRF-1(Reserved-18), 18 from QRF-1(Reserved-3) 20 General Guard Course (Reserve-1), 20 General Guard Course (Reserve-2), 20 Guard course (Reseve-3) including others having at least 25 SMGs, were submitted. Report is annexed as Annex-G.

On 20-06-2014 the T.V. Channels AAJ TV, Dunya TV, Express News, ARY Newx, Samma TV, News-one, Dawn, Waqat, CNBC, City 42, Channel-5, Value TV, Royal TV, Koh-i-Noor TV, Capital TV, Abtak TV, Jaag, Din TV were invited to produce all the relevant material. Thereafter some TV channels submitted CD's of the video clips alongwith snapshots. The Secretary Information Govt. of the Punjab, upon the direction of this Tribunal, also tendered CD's of the incident and that of press conferences.

On 21.06.2014 report was submitted by CCPO, Lahore, Shafiq Gujjar, stating in para 3 that it was Syed Altaf Hussain Shah, the Chief Security Officer of *Idara Minhaj ul Quran*, who fired with his SMG causing bullet injuries and deaths and the police retaliated with Tear Gas Shells. According to him a site plan was prepared but it was not made part of the record. He said that 63 civilians and 35 police officials injured and 9 persons died. According to him 44 persons sent to the judicial lock up.

On 23.06.2014 same CCPO submitted another report that out of 44 persons (produced before ATA Court on 19.06.2014) 23 were sent to judicial lock up and 21 to Jinnah Hospital, for medical examination, after which they were sent to judicial lock up.

On 21.06.2014 a Joint Investigation Team was constituted comprising 16 members including the convener and the co-opted members Under Section 19 of the ATA, 1997 in the FIR.

On 03.07.2014, 09.07.2014 and 18 .07.2014, the Joint Investigation Team submitted reports which are Annexes-J,

J/1, J/2 and J/3. On 19.06.2014, 20.06.2014, the DCO, Lahore, has placed on record photocopies of cheques of 3 million rupees in the names of legal heirs of 9 deceased persons to show that the Government is willing to compensate, which are attached as annexes-K, K/1, K/2, K/3, K/4, K/5, K/6, K/7, K/8 & K/9.

The Secretary Health, Government of Punjab has also submitted a report regarding medico legal examination of the injured and autopsy report of the deceased persons. Meanwhile, the advertisements were published in the newspapers and through the electronic media inviting any eye witness or any person having information about the incident to record their statements. The report is attached as Annex-L and the para-wise report is Annex-L-1.

On 30.06.2014, the CCPO Lahore submitted his report which he did not read before the Tribunal as, according to him, it contained some sensitive matters. On the same date, Rana Sana Ullah, Former Law Minister and Dr. Touqeer Shah,

Former Secretary to the Chief Minister, Punjab, submitted their affidavits who were also cross-examined on 25.07.2014.

The Commissioner, Lahore has also placed on record his report vide Annex-N. Statements of Doctors namely, Dr. Muzammal Hussain Bhatti, APMO, Jinnah Hospital, Lahore (IW-1), Dr. Zahid Manzoor, MO Jinnah Hospital, Lahore (IW-2), Dr. Fariha Aslam, CMO Ganga Ram Hospital, Lahore (IW-3), Dr. Shazia Mazoor, Forensic Department AIMC, Jinnah Hospital, Lahore (IW-4), Dr. Asma Mehmood, CMO, Sir Ganga Ram Hospital, Lahore (IW-5), Dr. Sajjad Karamat, DMLO (IW-6), and Dr. Anwar Mumtaz, DMLO Forensic Medicine, Services Hospital, Lahore, (IW-7) Dr. Ghulam Ghazi, (IW-8) and Dr. Iftikhar Ahmad Zahid (IW-9) were recorded.

Statements of civilian injured persons under treatment in hospital were recorded through District & Sessions Judge, Lahore/ Commission as Waqas Masih son of Niamat Masih, aged 18/19 years (IW-13). Rana Abdul Jabbar, DIG (Operations), (IW-14), Maroof Masood Safdar, SP (HQ) (IW-15), Awais Malik, SP Saddar (Operations) (IW-16), Miraj Din son

Jan Muhammad, aged 50/55 years (IW-9), Arslan Anjum son of Ghulam Rasool, aged 23 years (IW-10), and Haroon Khalid son of Khalid Mehmood, aged 25 years (IW-11) were not in a position to appear before the Tribunal.

1

The Inspector General, Police/PPO, Punjab, also provided copies of SOPs (Standard Operation Procedure) for communication of the orders to the police officials on ground during the operation such like the one under probe.

Muhammad Umar Virk, SP, CIA (IW-17), Dr. Farrukh Raza, SP (Operations) (IW-18), Muhammad Maroof Masood Safdar Wahla, SP (HQ) (IW-15), Syed Abdul Raheem Sherazi, SP (Mobiles) (IW-20), Salman Ali Khan, former SP (Security) (IW-21), Muhammad Tariq Aziz, former SP, Model Town (IW-22), Rana Sana-Ullah, former Law Minister Punjab(IW-23), Dr.Syed Tauqeer Hussain Shah, former Secretary to the Chief Minister (IW-24), Mir Kashif Khalil, DSP, Garden Town (IW-25), Zulfiqar Ali, Inspector (IW-26), Muhammad Ishtiaq, Inspector/SHO, PS, Kahna (IW-27), Rana Muhammad Islam, DSP/SDPO, Ichhra (IW-28), Muhammad Sharif, ASI No.2145-L

(IW-29), Raheel Ahmad Constable (IW-30), Muhammad Saien Constable Contable No.3202 (IW-31),Ameer Hussain (IW-32), Mian Javed Iqbal (IW-33) have been No.19956 examined. Affidavits have been submitted by Agha Ramzan Ali, SP VVIP Security, Mumtaz Hussain SI/SHO, Magsood Ali, SHO/Inspector, Imran Ali Constable No.2045, Irfan Ali Constable No.19997, Muhammad Jamil Constable 10810, Ghulam Ali Constable No.724, Imdad Ali Constable No.20561, Muhammad Irfan Constable No.22239, Amjad Ali Constable No.20850, No.20070, Muhammad Afzal Constable Naghmana Yasmin daughter of Mirza Ahmad Din, resident of St. No.17, House No.540/3, Qadria Colony, Mughalpura, Lahore.

The Cell Phone data of Rana Sana Ullah, Former Law Minister and Dr. Touqueer Shah, Former Principal Secretary to the Chief Minister, Punjab, Home Secretary, Commissioner, CCPO, DCO Lahore, Rana Abdul Jabbar, then DIG (Operations), Lahore, Tariq Aziz, then SP (Operations) Model Town, Maroof Wahla, then SP Headquarter, Malik Awais, then

SP (Operations) Saddar, Umer Virk, then SP CIA/Organized Crime, Farrukh Raza, then Addl. SP (Operations) Iqbal Town, Muhammad Nadeem, then SP (Investigation) Model Town, Agha Muhammad Ramzan, then SP Flying Squad, Abdul Raheem Sherazi, then SP Mobiles, Salman Ali Khan, then SP Security, Lahore was provided which was handed over to Asad Ali Khan, Deputy Director, ISI for analysis who also submitted his report.

21

The SP, Special Branch has also submitted his report of the incident and also of the facts and circumstances before the incident. Mansoor Alam, Director Admn, IB and Sajid Bilal, Director IB, Lahore also submitted report of the IB. A report was also submitted by Deputy Director ISI.

On behalf of police, affidavits of Rana Abdul Jabbar, then DIG (Operations), Lahore, Tariq Aziz, then SP (Operations) Model Town, Maroof Wahla, then SP Headquarter, Malik Awais, then SP (Operations) Saddar, Ume Virk, then SP CIA/Organized Crime, Farrukh Raza, then Addl. SP (Operations) Iqbal Town, Muhammad Nadeem, then SP

(Investigation) Model Town, Agha Muhammad Ramzan, then SP Flying Squad, Abdul Raheem Sherazi, then SP Mobiles, Salman Ali Khan, then SP Security, Meer Kashif Khalil, DSP, Garden Town, Zulfigar Ali, Inspector/SHO, P.S. Gulberg, Muhammad Ishtiaq, Inspector/SHO, P.S. Kahna, Rana Islam, Model Ichhra Town Division, DSP/SPO Magsood Ali. Insector/SHO, P.S. Qilla Gujjar Singh, Mumtaz Hussain, SI/SHO Garden Town, Muhammad Ashraf, ASI, Raheel Ahmed, Constable, Muhammad Irfan, Constable, Imdad Ali, Constable, Ghulam Ali, Constable, Muhammad Saien. Constable, Aamir Hussain, Constable, Muhammad Jameel, Constable, Irfan Ali, Constable and Imran Ali, Constable have been submitted. Mian Javed, an eye witness of the occurrence appeared alongwith certified copies of orders passed in ICA No. 155 of 2011 whose evidence was also recorded.

.

A report submitted by the Chief Secretary, Punjab obtained on 26.06.2014 is Annex-N and report by the Home Secretary, is Annex-O. A report was also submitted by the Secretary Establishment Government of Pakistan of the facts

and circumstances requiring the transfer of Khan Baig, former I.G.P. dated 24.07.2014, which is Annex-N/1.

3

At the conclusion of proceedings Mian Muhammad Shehbaz Sharif, the Chief Minister, Punjab has also submitted his duly sworn affidavit through his representative namely Abdul Qayyum, Special Secretary, Chief Minister Office, which has been made part of the record.

Mr. Khurram Nawaz Gundapur, Nazime-e-Ala, Tehreek Minjah-ul-Quran, has sent a letter addressed to the Registrar of this Tribunal wherein it has been stated that since Punjab Police has refused to register FIR despite all the *Shahadats* of the workers and dozens of injuries resulting from the direct firing of the personnel of the Punjab Police, therefore, unless their FIR is registered, they will not become party of any investigation which is being conducted on the basis of the malicious FIR. Letter and proposal of second FIR are Annex-Q.

POSITIONS.

Mian Muhammad Shehbaz Sharif, Chief Minister, Punjab.

Y

The position taken by Mian Muhammad Shehbaz Sharif, Chief Minister, Punjab through a duly sworn affidavit is that on the morning of 17th June 2014 he came to know through Television about the standoff between contingents of police and workers of Minjah-ul-Quran near the secretariat of Minjah-ul-Quran, where after he asked his secretary Dr. Syed Taquir Shah, who told that it was the decision taken by Rana Sana Ullah, Former Law Minister, Punjab to remove the illegal encroachment around the said Idara. He immediately expressed his dismay for not informing him, and passed on direction "dis-engage forthwith". After attending the oath taking ceremony of Chief Justice Lahore High Court, Lahore, scheduled at 10.30 he came back to Model Town for his other planned pre-occupations during which he was informed that a serious law and order situation has developed resulting in number of casualties and injuries to the civilians and police

personnel upon which he took certain decisions including the one for appointment of a Tribunal of Inquiry by a Judge of the High Court, and immediately removed CCPO, Lahore, DIG (Operations) and SP Model Town from their respective posts.

Chief Secretary Government of Punjab

While relying upon the various notifications issued by Federal as well as Punjab Govt. he tried to demonstrate that the transfer of I.G. Punjab, was only a routine matter

Mr. Nadeem Hassan Asif, Secretary Establishment Division, Government of Pakistan.

He stated that in the background of *Zarb-e-Adhab* the Govt of Punjab expressed its apprehensions regarding possible blow back and terrorist activities in urban areas of the province, therefore with the concurrence of the Govt. of Baluchistan conveyed on 13-6-2014, Mr. Mushtaq Ahmed,the PPO Baluchistan was posted as Principle Police Officer, Punjab on 14-6-2014.

Home Secretary Government of Punjab.

A meeting, chaired by minister for law and Local Government, was convened on 16-6-2014 at the secretariat to discuss, inter alia, the removal of the barriers/barricades on the public roads around the *Idara* Minhaj ul Quran and to discuss the possible law and order situation on the arrival of Dr. Tahir ul Qadri on 23-6-2014 in which the chair directed to remove them in accordance with law. According to him the information gathered between 9.00 am to 11.30 am the situation on the ground was not tense, and would be controlled in short span of time, and that the public life was not in danger. He was also conveyed the C.M's concern through his secretary who was informed that as per information given by DCO and DIG (Operations), both present at the site, were trying to resolve the matter peacefully. This fact was furthered confirmed by CCPO, Lahore.

Inspector General of Police, Punjab

After taking over the charge as PPO Punjab at 11.30 am on 17-6-2014 he received the information about the incident at 12.00 noon, according to which on the previous night the SHO, PS Model Town received an information through AC Model Town that the later and the TMO staff were offered fierce resistance from the PAT workers in performance of their operations regarding the removal of barriers and hurdles in the area of residence of Dr. Tahir-ul-Qadri, 299-M and 365-M, Model Town, Lahore. According to the said information, about 300 PAT workers attracted at the site, started brick batting and indiscriminate firing, etc. on police and TMO staff. As a result of firing and brick-batting between both sides eight persons succumbed to their injuries whereas 103 persons including police officials received injuries. 19 persons admitted in the hospitals. Consequently, a criminal case bearing FIR no 510/2014 was registered at the behest of Inspector/SHO, namely, Rizwan Qadir, U/S 302/34,324,353,186,148,149,291,290,427,506-B, PPC

read with 13/13-B, Arms Ordinance, XX of 1965,A.O. read with S. 7-A.T.A. In subsequent reports, the I.G Punjab reproduced the verbatim of the FIR and kept on mentioning the progress in the investigation.

Capital City Police Officer, Lahore.

As per his report, the CCPO, Lahore, did not participate in the meeting held on 6-6-2014 at Secretariat as he had joined late and was informed by the Commissioner, Lahore, that a decision to conduct the operation has been made. On 14-6-2014 as per information made available to him by the field officers about 2000/3000 PAT miscreants had gathered around the Idara who had detained the police officials and created a hostage like situation and injured three police officials through bullet shots made from the roof tops of *Idara* and the residence of Dr. Tahir ul Qadri which resulted into the deaths of their own workers who were trying to leave. According to him the police officials also returned fire in selfdefense on their own.52 PAT miscreants were detained and 2 SMGs and three 30 bore pistols were taken into possession.

At about 12.30 after rescuing the hostages and dispersing the mob the police started withdrawal .F.I.R NO;510/14 P.S. Faisal Town was registered.

EVIDENCE OF WITNESSESS

Dr. Mozammal Bhatti APMO, Jinnah Hospital, Lahore (IW-1).

4

He conducted the medical examination of 13 injured police officials, namely, Mohd. Amjad, Zulfiqar, Raheel,Rizwan Qadir,Mumtaz Hussain, Mohammad Saien, Imdad Ali, Ghulam Ali,Mohammad Afzal, Maqsood Ali, Nadeem Iqbal, Tayyab Tariq, Zeeshan Akram

Dr.Zahid Manzoor DMLE, Jinnah Hospital, Lahore(IW-2)

He examined 10 injured police officials namely, Shakeel Falak, Mohamad Ishtiaq, Mohammed Sharif, Mohammad Islam, Kashif Khalid Meer, Tariq Aziz (SP,Model Town),Mohammed Jamil, Mohammed Irfan Syed Ihsan Abid,and issued their MLCs.and got them exhibited ,accordingly.

He also conducted the post mortems of deceased, namely, Safdar Hussain s/o Ali Mohammad aged, 35 y, Umer s/o Siddique, aged 21y,Shahbaz Ali s/o Fazal Hussain agd 24y,and got exhibited the autopsies report accordingly.

Dr. Fariha Aslam, CMO, Sir Ganga Rama Hospital, Lahore,(IW-3)

1

She examined 7 police officials namely, Mohammad Zubair/c,Abid Rasheed/SHO, Umer Riaz,SP Civil Lines,Javaid Iqbal /c,Nadeem Iqbal/c, Hohammad Afzal/c, Mohammad Naeem/c and issued their MLCs which were got exhibited accordingly.

Dr. Shazia Manzoor, AIMC, Jinnah Hospital (IW-4).

She conducted the autopsies of dead bodies of two females, namely, Shazia w/o Murtaza, aged 29 y and Tanzeela w/o Amjad ,30y who got exhibited the post mortem reports accordingly.

Dr.Asma Mehmood, CMO, Sir Ganga Ram Hospital, Lahore (IW-5)

She medically examined Maqsood SHO, PS Qilla Gujjar Singh, Lahore, and issued the MLC which has been exhibited accordingly.

Dr. Sajid Karamat, DMLO, Forensic Medicine, Services Hospital, Lahore. (IW-6)

.

He medically examined two police constables, namely, Muddasar Ali, and Mohammad Bilal and issued the MLCs which were exhibited accordingly.

Dr. Anwaar Mumtaz DMLO ,Forensic Medicine , Services Hospital , Lahore.(IW-7)

He medically examined four police constables, namely, Imran Ali, Irfan Ali Ghulam Abbas and Amir Hassan and issued MLCs and produced them on record which have been exhibited accordingly.

Dr. Ghulam Ghazi ,Demonstrator Forensic Medicine and Toxicology , Allam Iqbal Medical College, Lahore,(IW-8)

He conducted the autopsies of dead bodies of deceased, namely, Asim s/o Mairaj Din aged 22y,Iqbal Hussain s/o Khair Din ,aged 42y, Ghulam Rasool s/o Mohmmad Bukhsh, Khawar Naweed s/o Fazal Ahmed aged 20y, and prepared the post mortem reports and produced them on the record which has been exhibited accordingly.

Dr. Iftikhar Ahmed Zahid, Demonstrator Forensic Medicine Jinnah Hospital, Lahore, (IW-9)

He conducted the postmortem of Dead body of Rizwan Khan s/o Khan Mohammad aged 25y and produced the post mortem report on the record which has been exhibited accordingly.

Injured Mairaj Din s/o Jan Mohammaed (IW-10)

He was present in the *Idara* in connection with the Aitekaf preparation when he saw 300/400 police officials present there indulged in straight firing with their big weapons. He was hit on the upper portion of his left leg. His son, Mohammed Asim, also sustained fire shots and embraced *Shahadat*. He categorically stated that the purpose of the Government behind all this was to create terrorism as a result thereof 14 innocent lives were taken and 80 injured.

Injured Arsalan Anjum s/o Ghulam Rasool. (IW-11)

He is a member and student of *Idara Minhaj-l-Quran* and used to live in the hostel. He alongwith his friends Ghulam Mustafa and Hafiz Syed Wajahat Ali reached at 10.30 am out side the

house of Dr. Qadri where he received fire shot at lower portion of left leg. Three identifiable Police officials had been beating him by sticks in the injured condition.

Injured Haroon Khalid s/o Khalid Mahmood (IW-12)

At 8.00 am he alongwith Akram reached at Idara to attend Aitekaf Session and saw 2000/3000 police officials present there using tear gas on male and female children in order to remove the barriers installed for security purposes. The tear gas shelling continued for 2/3 hours during which police also resorted to severe baton charge. Some SP came who was shown the High Court Order by the senior workers but he replied that they had strict instructions from high ups ie; the CM and the Law Minister to remove the barriers at any cost. The negotiations were on but at 11.00/11.30 Elite Force reached where after at 11.30 police launched the attack upon the crowd, initially by throwing stone and heavy tear gas shelling at all of them. The police, initially, made aerial firing and then straight firing on the PAT members under direct orders from high ups. He sustained fire arm injuries upon his

both legs at about 12.30 pm. He stated that police neither allowed the rescue workers nor the private persons to come forward, but instead continued to fire on those who were voluntarily trying to attend the injured persons.

Injured Waqas Masih s/o Niamat Masih (IW-13)

He, a friend of Shahbaz (deceased of Model Town incident), met the later and at his instance he accompanied him on a truck to *Idara* and reached there at 9.00 am where people were pelting stones on one hundred Police officials armed with Kalashnikov, G.M., M.P.G. and .44 bore rifles/guns who, in return, were making straight firing .At 11.00 am they heard the deaths of two females who were chased and shot by police .When he was throwing stones he made his head down and a fire shot passed above his head at a bit height, but as he tried to throw the second stone, suddenly a fire shot hit him on his left side of neck and he fell down. However, his friend Shahbaz (deceased) also received a fire shot injury on his neck . All this happened at about mid-day. He also saw other private persons sustaining fire arm injuries. The police were

firing at a distance of 60/70 feet near the residence of Dr. Tahir-ul-Qadri.

Rana Abdul Jabbar .D.I.G (Operations), Lahore (IW-14)

The then DIG operations stated that on 16-6-2014 he was informed that as a routine matter some police assistance was required for the operation for the removal of the illegal barriers installed at and around the *Idara Minhaj-ul-Quran*. However, on 17-6-2014 in view of the violent attitude of the PAT workers he was compelled to go himself along with the DCO, Lahore, to resolve the matter amicably as it was not an operation against any set of criminals but an ordinary affair but having a likelihood of being turning ugly. On 17-6-2014 at about 8.45 am he went at the *Idara* near the Govt. Model College for Boys negotiating in order and started to persuade administration of the *Idara* to cooperate in removal of the illegal barriers or, in alternate, seconded the earlier offer made by AC Model Town and the S.P Model Town to withdraw subject to a written undertaking by them to remove the illegal barriers on their own but they turned a deaf ear. At about 9.30 am the PAT workers started piling up that had been throwing stones and the petrol bombs and firing from their respective positions. Meanwhile, three police officials received bullet shots totally unprovoked at a time when the police might want to peacefully withdraw after the recovery of the besieged police officials. He stated that despite loss of life and property the police remained calm though it had become imperative to disperse the armed mob just to normalize the situation. During the processes the police faced fierce resistance who kept on firing indiscriminately from various roof tops and places and during this some police officials returned fire in self-defense on their own without orders. Since there was a heavy gun fire, therefore, it was impossible to ascertain from distance if police officials had indulged in fire for protecting themselves. According to the DIG the police refrained from committing any illegality throughout the incident especially in terms of any disproportionate aggression; far from being aggressive can best be described as purely reactive and engaged primarily in the rescue/evacuation of government functionaries in difficult and challenging times. In cross examination he did not admit either ordering fire or deployment of snipers on the roof tops and that after hearing the shots he shouted to stop firing. He had stated not to have witnessed any causality or injury.

M. Maroof Masood Safdar Wahla S.P. (Head Quarters) (IW15)

He stated that he had a staff assignment with no operational responsibility reached at the site at 10.15 am with three reserves anti-riot equipment under the orders of DIG operations. He was injured with blunt weapon and at about 12.00 noon he heard the gunshots quite away from his position which continued for 15 to 20 minutes. He did not see any PAT worker firing though police officials were firing in the air.

Awais Malik, S.P.Saddar, (Operations) (IW-16).

Stated that on the orders of DIG operations he reached at the site of the degree college at about 11.25 am where eight SHOs of Lahore were already present with their force. When he

reached at the International market, PAT workers were firing, throwing bricks and patrol bombs .He did not see any one being injured. The police had to scatter but rejoined .Meanwhile, as per order by the DIG he with his force reported the SP security at the front of *Idara* where the DIG reached and stopped them from entering the building of the *Idara*. However, neither he nor his subordinate police officials made any fire shot

Mohammad Umar Virk, S.P. (Organized Crime), Lahore. (IW-17)

He received a phone call from DIG operations at about 12.00 pm to reach the site upon which he along with his police officials arrived at International Market where it was all over. The police had encircled the *Idara* and the City District Government was removing the debris. SP Security persuaded to go inside the main building of the *Idara* as the fires were coming from the roof tops but he said that since the barriers have been removed ,therefore, they should leave and DIG (Operations), SP (Security) and he left the site. He, however,

said that the police and the District Government had some unfinished agenda.

Dr. Farrukh Raza, ADDL S.P (Operations) Allama Iqbal Town, Lahore, (IW-18)

At 11.15 am, he along with his S.H.Os of police stations Nawankot, Sherakot, Millatpark, Ghulshan Ravi, and Muslim Town, reported the D.I.G Operations outside Government Model Town Degree College for Boys. He was instructed by D.I.G to stay there till further orders who moved ahead with officers and *Naffri* already present there. After some time he heard exchange of fierce firing. Later, he heard fire shots and saved himself and at about 12.00 noon he noted that the firing had subsided, therefore, he along with his Nafri left the site.

Mohammad Nadeem, Sp (Inv.) Model Town, Lahore (IW-19)

He reached at the site at 11.45 with his available staff and met the DIG (Operations) near Govt. Degree College, Model Town and was directed to provide the backup support to the police from operational division. Later at 1.00 pm he was ordered to go back to *Kotha Pind* stop and he left the site.

Syed Abdul Raheem Shirazi, SP, (Mobiles), Lahore (IW-20)

On 17-6-2014 he reached the venue at about 4.00 am and saw a charged mob and as per order left the site at 5.15 am. However, at 11.00 am he reported to DIG (Operations) on direction by SP (Security) at Govt. Degree College. He categorically stated that the SP security had ordered the Elite contingent through Qurban Control to report at the venue and in compliance the Elite was already there at 10.40 am. He reported to DIG (Operations) at 11.45 am who ordered to remove the bus being used as a shield by the mob, and to further consolidate the area already cleared by the advance team officers. Having removed the bus he had followed the trail of advancing police party to the house and saw several officers outside. Women present outside the house had altercation with police constables who refused the clear the area. A woman assaulted and grabbed him by the collar with her both hands and abused him. At the roof tops he saw the armed gun men and informed the DIG and left the site under his orders.

Salman Ali Khan, former S.P. (Security), (IW-21)

Entrusted with the duty to assist the DIG (Operations) in maintaining the law and order situation, he on 17-6-2014 at 8.00 am was directed by the said DIG to assist the SP, Model Town at the site of operation .He reached the International market situated in the area of the occurrence at on 9.30 am where he saw stones, bricks, bottles and teargas shells on the roads. About 300/400/ PAT workers were present armed with Lathis and some with handguns. He was attacked and injured. The police ran for taking shelter at veranda of nearby buildings. Since he along with police personnel was made hostage and under siege in different pockets, and were rescued by few constables during which he received minor injuries. He again came under attack and ran away and were followed by armed miscreants who resorted to strait firing upon them resulting into a fire arm injury to Zeeshan, constable. He was rescued to the degree college at about 10.15 am where DIG operations and other police officials including SPs Model Town, Civil Lines ,H.Q., D.C.O., Lahore also came

who appraised the DIG operations about the situation. He demanded police reinforcement at around 11.00 am. Accordingly, it was decided that an effort would be made from college side onward through different degree disperse/arrest the PAT miscreants and to rescue as well as recover the kidnapped, besieged and wounded police personnel. At around 11.30 am he along with his operator moved and dispatched the force towards the Minhaj park situated in front of Idara. The police present there tried to rescue where after the miscreants started dispersing but kept on firing indiscriminately from various roof tops and building and other positions, during which he with some police officials resorted to benign and harmless self-defense aerial firing which had not caused any fire arm injury to any PAT worker, though had seen the aggression at their hands. At 11.50 am he, SPs Model Town, H.Q simultaneously reached with their force at the front of Idara and shortly joined by DIG (Operations), DCO, Lahore, SP Saddar, and SP, CIA whereafter PAT workers were arrested and the firing from the PAT workers ended.

Tariq Aziz, SP, Model Town (IW-22)

He remained in touch with AC, Model Town since last night and the PAT workers were increasing and at about 2.10 am, he tried to persuade the General Secretary of PAT to cooperate in the operation but he had shown the order of the Lahore High Court, which was turned as irrelevant. No written undertaking was given for the voluntary removal of the barriers. Due to the aggression by the PAT workers he tried to persuade the DCO to withdraw but he insisted otherwise Later, the DIG also ordered to collect the SHOs and SDPOs at the site. Meanwhile, they were attacked by the PAT workers who resorted to severe aerial firing. One Sharif, ASI, was beaten up and made hostage upon which the DIG assured for sending force from other division for assistance. The SDPO, Model Town, Ichra, Khana and SHOs Gulberg, Garden Town, Ichra, Shadman, Liagatabad, Naseerabad, Nishter, Khana and Kotlakhpat arrived and the official was rescued in semiconscious condition. During this time the PAT workers kept firing and took positions at the roof-tops of the International Market. The police did not fire. At around 8.45 am DIG (Operations) along with DCO reached the spot who tried to negotiate with the PAT leaders. Meanwhile, at about 9.15 am SP Civil Lines also reached wherafter, DIG, (Operations), directed him to line up the force and coordinate. SP security also joined in and in a coordinated effort the crowd was pushed back during which (he) SP Model Town was injured. The PAT workers had been firing from the rooftops of the International Market resulting into bullet injury to three constables at around 10.30 am. However, at 11.00 am he reached near the Govt. Model Degree College where he met DIG (Operations), SP, Security, and SP, Headquarter where a discussion was held to handle the situation. All the SPs were directed by DIG (Operations) to take a round of the M-Block to ascertain the numbers of PAT workers and to see their entries. After that they reached the Degree college. Further stated that DIG ops directed the officers present to make an effort to disperse the mob already reached upto Gov. Degree College. He categorically stated that as the force moved on he felt badly exhausted due 24 hour sleeplessness and the injury so he could not move on and went to Hotel Alpine for rest. However, at about 12.00 he was informed by his wireless operator that since the protesters have been pushed back and the police is approaching *Idara* therefor he also moved there. There he saw two armed PAT activists present on the roof tops and the police officials were shouting to save themselves from the bullets. He also met DCO, DIG (Operations), SPs Security, Headquarters, Civil Lines and CIA. Upon the order of DCO the encroachments were being removed but the Crain driver refused to drive due to direct fire on the Crain a private person , namely, Gullu Butt started driving it .Later, he met him and surprisingly embraced him as an acknowledgment .//

Rana Sana Ullah, Former Law Minister, Punjab, (IW-23)

On 16th of June 2014 a meeting was held to discuss law and order agreements and maintenance of peace, security and public order in view of call made by Dr. Tahir-ul-Qadri, to hold "Long March" from Rawalpindi/Islamabad to Lahore on 23.06.2014 which the of illegal in matter encroachments/barriers on the public road around Idara Minhaj-ul-Quran was also discussed in pursuance of the last meeting. As the Commissioner, Lahore, reported that several illegal barriers/encroachments were erected around *Idara* on the public roads blocking the right of way, therefore, after obtaining view of the participants present in the meeting, he decided that illegal encroachments be removed with immediate effect. On 17th June 2014 at 9:00 AM he saw a portrayals of events displayed on various T.V. Channels and received a phone call from Dr. Syed Tauqir shah, Secretary to Chief Minster, Punjab twice at 9:00 and 11:30 conveying his concern where after he called up, inter alia, CCPO Lahore and Home Secretary upon which former informed him that police was mobilized to remove the illegal encroachments and that the situation was under control. In cross-examination he acknowledged the report submitted by Special Branch, Government of Punjab about the proposed grand alliance by

Dr. Tahir-ul-Qadri, against Government. Dr. Syed Tauqir Shah, also remained present in the meeting dated 16th June 2014 wherein he consented on behalf of the Chief Minister, Punjab for the removal of barriers/operation. The Advocate General Office was not consulted regarding interpretation of order passed by Lahore High Court in ICA No. 155 of 2011 before the operation. According to him the said meeting was also attended by Home Secretary and a representative of Special Branch. He told CCPO, Lahore, not to create any "Tamasha". On 17th June 2014 he talked DIG (Operations) at 12:15 and 12:30. He firmly took a stand about the correct timing of operation and has stated that no orders for shooting were ever issued and that he does not accept the responsibility of the unfortunate incident. According to him he was not conveyed about the gravity of situation, therefore, he could not review his decision. However, at 12:20 he was informed by DIG (Operations) through telephone of Rana Mashhood, present Law Minster, Punjab that the operation has been completed. By that time, he denied any casualty.



Dr. Syed Tauqir Hussain Shah, Secretary to Chief Minister, Punjab. (IW-24)

He attended the meeting on 16th June 2014, though reached late than the scheduled time and by that time most of the items had been discussed and in his presence Law Minister decided to remove the illegal barriers/encroachments where after he left the meeting as he had to attend the budget discussion in Provincial Assembly. On 17th June 2014 he did not go to his office as he was unwell. He received a call from the Chief Minister, Punjab in the morning who inquired about standoff between police and Idara-Minhaj workers showing in the T.V. whereupon he informed that in the meeting chaired by Minister of Law, Punjab on a day before, a decision has already been taken to remove the barriers around Minhaj-ul-Quran, whereupon he expressed his dismay for not informing him and issued the order "dis-engage". He accordingly informed the Home Secretary and the Law Minister who responded that situation on ground is expected to be normalized/controlled shortly. According to him he again called Home Secretary of Law Minister at 11:45 AM in which

Chief Minister's observations. In he reiterates crossexamination he admitted that Commissioner Lahore had some reservations for the operation and that no discussion regarding the use of force either as an initiative or as a reaction of expected force was made. He, however, consented on behalf of the Chief Minister to the decision .Since the matter was not in the purview of the Chief Minister, therefore, he did not convey the said decision to the Chief Minister. The decision of the Chief Minister to "dis-engage" was conveyed to the Home Secretary at 10:00 am and to the Law Minister at 10:15 am after putting quite an efforts which consumed some time. He, however, expressed his surprise as to why the orders of the Chief Minister, was not properly executed.

Y

Mir Kashif Khalil DSP, Garden Town Circle, Lahore (IW-25). Injured due to pelting stone and reached to Jinnah Hospital for treatment at 10.00 am. He filed the attested copy of MLC

Zulfiqar Ali, Inspector/SHO P.S. Gulberg (IW-26)

Injured due to brick batting at 9.00 and taken to the Jinnah Hospital. He filed the attested copy of MLC

Mohammad Ishtiaq, Inspector/SHO PS Kahna (IW-27).

Injured by brick batting while saving Rizwan Qadir /SHO at 9.00 am and was taken tom the hospital. He filed the attested copy of MLC.

Rana Mohamad Islam, DSP/SDPO, Ichra Model Town Division (IW-28).

Injured due to brick batting and taken to the Hospital at 3.30.am on 17-6-2014 He filed the attested copy of MLC

Mohammad Sharif ASI, PS Khana (IW-29)

On 17-6-2014, at 2.25 am he received a call from Model Town Control to report SP Model Town at Idara and at 3.25 he reached there .At 4.00 am joined the Naffri and moved ahead whereupon he sustained injury on his face by a stone thrown by students of Minhaj-ul-Quran. He fell unconscious and came into senses at Jinnah Hospital during his treatment. He filed the attested copy of MLC

Raheel Ahmed, Constable No.4409, Police Lines Qilla Gujjar Singh, Lahore (IW-30)

On 17-6-2014 at 10.30 am he reached at the ground and was injured due to the brick injury at left eye at the hands of the PAT workers and became unconscious and found himself in the hospital. He filed the attested copy of MLC.

Mohammad Saien, Constable No.3202, PS. Naseerabad (IW-31).

He received injury at his left eye at 10.00 am and was taken to hospital in Rescue 1122. He filed the attested copy of MLC.

Amir Hussain, Constable No;19956, PS, Wahdat Colony (IW-32).

He reached at 12.00 noon on 17-6-2014 and sustained an injury on his right hand caused by a broken piece of glass and was taken to the hospital. He did not know whether anyone was killed though he heard the gun shots. He filed the attested copy of MLC.

Mian Javed Iqbal S/o Mian Ahmed Khan, R/o House No.328, M-Block Model Town, Lahore,(IW-33)

He is resident of vicinity of Idara-Minhaj-ul-Quran. There was always a danger of terrorism in the vicinity. About 50 houses

are situated near by the house of Allama Tahir-ul-Qadri and Minhaj-ul- Quran. Having perceived the sense of insecurity and for the sake of protection of life of their children the inhabitant of the area he filed an ICA No.155/11, in the Lahore High Court, Lahore in which an order was passed to police to secure and provide safeguard to their life and In the wake of directions of Lahore High Court, Lahore, the then SP, Model Town inspected the vicinity and ordered to DSP and SHO of PS Faisal Town to erect and install security barriers. The said arrangement was made on selfbasis by the inhabitance of the area. Due to this arrangement of security no incidence of terrorism had taken place. Till that day none of government institution raised any objection over the said security barriers. On 17-06-2014 at about 2:00 am the inhabitance were sleeping when all of a sudden he heard fire shots, came out and inquired from the police officials the reasons of said firing. They told him that police came only to remove the barriers. He brought the decision of Lahore High Court Lahore from his house and handed over to police

V.

officers. The said police officers did not pay any heed to it rather one just poured the order in his pocket. The police contumaciously acted and committed the contempt of court. The arm police personals used indecent language with women workers standing at the gate of Tahir-ul-Qadri house. They also mal-handled the women. Meanwhile, the armed police personal made straight fire shot at women and male workers and martyred them. He produced the certified copies of orders passed in ICA 155/2011 in evidence.

VZ.

AFFIDAVITS

Agha Ramzan Ali, SP, VVIP Security Lahore, tendered his affidavit supporting the version of SP Model Town about Gullu Butt.

Mumtaz Hussain SI/SHO PS Garden Town, Lahore,
Maqsood Ali SHO/Inspector P.S Qilla Gujjar Singh, Lahore,
Imran Ali Constable No.2045,
Irfan Ali Constable No.19997,
Mohammad Jamil Constable No.10810,
Ghulam Ali Constable No. 724,
Imdad Ali Constable No20561 and
Mohammad Irfan Constable No.22239, submitted their duly
sworn affidavits stating that they received blunt injuries

Amjad Ali Constable No. 20070,

through brick batting and tendered their MLC.

æ,

Submitted his affidavit that he sustained fire arm injury at left shin by an identifiable person and was shifted to the hospital but he did not submit MLC.

Mohammad Afzal, Constable No.20850

He submitted an affidavit that he sustained a fire arm injury at his right foot by someone from the crowd who were also pelting stones and were moving towards police. He also tendered his MLC.

Imran Hussain s/o Mohammad Boota, Muthtar Ahmed s/o Mohammad Hussain, Waqas Ahmed s/o Gulzar Ahmed and

Kh. Sohail Maqbul s/o Maqbool Ahmed claiming to the resident of the area of Model Town and LDA flats submitted their affidavits supporting the police version. However, they neither produced the copies of their CNIC nor mentioned it in their affidavits

REPORTS OF INTER SERVICES INTELLIGENCE, INTELLIGENCE BUREAU AND SPECIAL BRANCH.

REPORT OF ISI:

7

In the report submitted by D.D.I.S.I., it is stated that Mr. Khurram Nawaz Gandapur, Nazim-e-Aala MQI the General Secretary of PAT alongwith CSO Syed Altaf Hussain, produced the Lahore High Court Orders for placement of security barriers in the said locality to the imminent threat but he police did not pay any heed to it rather remained firm to remove the barriers. It was about 01:30 am on 17-6-2014 that the police attempted to remove the barriers forcibly. This effort of police was resisted by PAT workers who started pelting stones and bricks at police. At this juncture, a subinspector of police in the company of SP, Model Town fired 3 rounds from his pistol in air, which resulted in stampede of the workers. At about 9:20 am in the morning of 17-06-2014 police contingent heavy moved toward Tahir-ul-Qadri

residence in the presence SSP operation Rana Abdul Jabbar, DCO Lahore, Capt. (Retired) Usman. This was strongly resisted by MQI workers. When the police managed to reach in front of Dr. Tahir ul Qadri's house, the lady workers offered resistance in their entry into the house. However, the ISI has not confirmed the report that security guard stationed at the post established at the roof top of the house also fired a single fire shot due to which police retreated. Later, at about 11:00 am the elite force was called and police again attempted to take charge in MQI secretariat and Tahir-ul-Qadri residence. The ISI categorically mentioned in its report that during the assault the police also resorted to aimed fire which resulted into 10 deaths and over 70 injured out of which 51 persons sustained bullet injuries. At about 13:15 hours the SSP operation informed on telephone about the operation which ended in a success. The hundreds of police personnel participated in the operation during which the police also caused damaged to many shops of the market situated in the vicinity.

The O.C. I.S.I. Sub-Sector, Lahore, intervened after having realized the severity of situation and its repercussions contacted Dr. Tauqueer Shah, Secretary to CM Punjab by way of a call at about 12:30 pm on his mobile phone who replied that he was not feeling well and did not know about details as he could not attend his office.

REPORT OF IB:

It was reported that at about 09/09:30 am on 17.06.2014 the police made another attempt while using tear Gas, etc. to advance toward Minhaj-ul-Quran Secretariat and when this section of police reached near the secretariat a guard manning the post on first floor of the terrace of Tahir-ul-Qadri house opened straight fire which left two policemen injured. The news spread among the police circle that they have been killed by PAT workers. On this the police contingents advanced and the sympathizers of PAT/TMQ started pelting stones at police. The police as retaliation resorted to the firing towards protestors/agitators leaving many persons injured at the site of incident, some of them succumbed to their injuries

afterward. The police arrested many PAT workers including men and women present there. In total 10 PAT workers were killed whereas 96 were wounded including 29 police officials, 45 PAT workers received fired arm injuries.

REPORT OF SPECIAL BRANCH:

It was stated in the report that following the meetings held between Ch. Shujat Hussain and Tahir-ul-Qadri in London, it decided to form an alliance against the Government for which a committee was constituted to finalize the modalities which contacted Imran Khan, Faroog Sattar, Sahibzada Hamid Raza, Sarwat Ijaz Qadri, Sh. Rashid Ahmed, Pir Ijaz Hussain Hashmi and Lt. Gen (R) Hamid Gul in order to launched a campaign against present Government and corrupt system under the name of 'Hakoomat Hatao' campaign. It was further stated in the report that Tahir-ul-Qadri was bound to come to Pakistan on 23-06-2014 for which the PAT workers were preparing for warm welcome. Therefore, the report of special Branch was sent to Rana Sanaullah Khan, Minister for Law and Parliamentary Affairs, Mr. Naveed Akram Cheema, Chief Secretary, Punjab, Major (R) Azam Suleman Khan, Home Secretary, Dr. Syed Tauqir Hussain Shah, Secretary to Chief Minister, Mr.Naveed Haider Sherazi, PSO to Chief Minister's Government of the Punjab.

FACTS REVEALED CHRONOLOGICALLY

The whole operation lasted for more than 12 hours and in the intervening time following events were noticed;

At 12.45 (night).a contingent of police under the command of SP Model Town, Tariq Aziz, tried to open the barriers of the roads leading to *Idara* and the residence of Dr Tahir-ul-Qadri but the Security Guards of the *Idara* successfully resisted the move of police sometime—after when the negotiation between PAT leaders and Administration were held without any result.

At 1.30/2.00 am a discussion again started between Mr.Kurram Nawaz Gandapure, Nazim-e-Ala of Minhaj-ul-Quran International, S.P Model Town and Assistant Commissioner Model Town in the area where the PAT workers were slowly but surely increasing. In the said meeting held in the gathering of workers, the intention and efforts by the police to remove the barriers became a secret to none .Mr. Gandapur started complaining against actions of Government

and pleaded that barriers (encroachments) were installed as a consequence of orders passed by Lahore High Court, Lahore, in I.C.A No: 155/2011. It was reminded to them that earlier the then SP, Model Town visited vicinity in the wake of said order along with the concerned police officials and ensured the necessary security measures for the protection of the lives & property. The said arrangement remained in field for the last about three years. The appellant of said ICA, namely, Main Javed Igbal (Inquiry witness No-33) produced the said orders to the AC Model Town and SP Model Town but both did not pay any heed to the orders of High Court and put them in their pocket. Meanwhile, the AC Model Town offered to the administration of Minjaj-ul –Quran that if they gave in writing to remove the barriers on their own, the officials may leave to which they did not agree showing their stubbornness. The PAT workers as a retaliatory measures started pelting stones and throwing the bricks at police. While the PAT workers were pushed back a sub-Inspector of police accompanying the SP discharged three fire shots from his pistol in the air. This firing really was anothema to the PAT worker.

At 2.30 am situation became very tense when PAT workers in presence of their available leadership went on raising the slogans against Punjab Government simultaneously raising the strength of police to hundreds. The PAT workers were holding in their hands wooden sticks, whereas the police were armed with weapons and equipped with tear gas shell. This moment when practically the clash was Meanwhile, the PAT worker gave ultimatum to the SP Model Town to leave within ten minutes upon which he contacted the DIG (Operation), Rana Jabar, who directed to summon all SHOs and SDPOs to meet any eventuality. During this clash which continued till morning one ASI, namely Sharif was injured at the hands of PAT workers and was rescued by police by using tear gas from SHOs/SDPOs from police station of, Model Town, Ichhra, Kahna, Gulberg, Garden town, Shadman, Liaqatabad, Naseerabad, Nishtar, and Kotlakhpat reached at the scene under the orders.

At about 3.15 am the furious mob/workers PAT attacked upon police with whatever objects holding in their hands. In return the police started shelling tear gas and commenced the firing with SMGs . They also resorted to severe baton charge on the protestors, as a result of which persons from both sides injured. Till this time Authorities of the Government of Punjab could not perceive the fallout likely to happen as an after math.

At about 9.20 a.m. a heavy contingent of police was deployed which started advancing towards the residence of Dr. Tahir-ulthe under direct command of DIG Oadri operation, accompanied by DCO, Lahore Captain(R) Usman. advancement was highly resisted by PAT workers, though the police managed to reach in front of the house of Dr. Tahir-ul-Qadri. The SP Mobiles, Syed Abdul Rahim Sherazi, with police officials reached at the main gate of the house of Dr. Tahir-ul-Qadri . The women workers of PAT offered resistance who grabbed him by the collar. Two women, namely Shazia and Tanzeela were shot down. They both sustained firearm injuries

and removed to Jinnah Hospital Lahore at 12.00 p.m. It came on the record of this tribunal that armed police personnel reached at the gate of the residence of Dr. Tahir-ul-Qadri and started to break security cameras fixed over there. The police also dragged the women from their hair and beaten them by sticks. It was painfully noticed that armed policemen statedly manhandled the women and heard announcing to call "Hussain and Ali" to save them. The said women kept on raising the slogans of "Nara-e-Takbir" and "Narae-Haidry". Two women, namely Shazia and Tanzeela were shot down. They both sustained firearm injuries and removed to Jinnah Hospital, Lahore at 12.00 p.m. Meanwhile, the armed police personnel made straight fire shots which hit both women and men workers and injured many people. An important fact was revealed that in order to circumvent the aggressiveness of PAT workers DIG (Operations) got assembled with SP, HQ, Maroof Masood Safder, SP, Model Town, Tariq Aziz, SP, Security, Salman Ali Khan and DCO Lahore Capt. (R) Muhammad Usman, to devise the strategy to disperse the crowd from

Mihaj-ul-Quran park side. In wake of the strategy the SP's present there advanced with force. The facts reveal that till 10/11 am immense firing by the police was seen in the vicinity. Importantly, C.Ds provided by the private TV channels do not show any firing from Minhaj-ul-Quran workers' side and no PAT worker was seen wielded with firearm weapons. The PAT worker were only throwing the bricks and the petrol bombs.

It came on the record of this tribunal that armed police personnel reached at the gate of the residence of Dr.Tahir-ul-Qadri and started to break security cameras fixed over there.

At about 11 am when the SPs were reporting to DIG Operations at Government Boys College Model Town the SP security had already called for Elite Force/contingent via Quarban Control. It is the Affidavit of SP mobile that the Elite had already been there around at 10:40 am. The PAT worker present over there heard from each other at about 11:00 am that two women have been killed by police there as the police has turned furious. Injured, Waqas Masih, disclosed during



his evidence that when he tried to throw the second stone in a row, a fire shot hit him on his left side of his neck and his friend Shabaz also sustained fire shot injury on his neck who died later. The police kept on firing on the mob at the distance of 60/70 feet. Similarly, Arslan Anjum was hit by fire shot which landed on his lower portion of his left leg. The mob of 2000 people kept on offering resistance by throwing stones etc., at police. The police having seeing this made straight fire shots at the mob. One Haroon Khalid also sustained fire shot injuries on HIS both his legs. It was after reaching the Elite force at the site that the police advanced towards Minhaj-ul-Quran secretariat and Dr. Qadri's residence and during this assault the police resorted to aimed fire which resulted into ten deaths and 70 injured.

According to the medical record as produce by sectary Health the first firearm injured reached in the Jinnah Hospital, Lahore at 9:46 am and the rest of such injured person reached 2:23 pm. Amongst them nine wounded person who died, reached the hospital in between 12:02 pm to 2:18

pm. The distance between the place of occurrence and the Jinnah Hospital is not more than one Kilometer. This shows that the all injured person would have reached within 10 to 15 minutes.

At about 1:15 pm; the police entered into Mihaj-ul-Quran Secretariat after having demolished the barriers. The DIG Operations Lahore, Rana Abdul Jabbar, informed telephonically to I.G Punjab that operation has ended successfully. (this was noticed from the contents of the report submitted by one security agency). Strange enough the I.G Punjab in its first report did not disclose the same for the reasons best known to him.

FACTS UN-EARTH

It was rather a consensus oriented atmosphere for the support of armed forces indulged in Zarb-Adab, an operation against the terrorists, as all major political parties *prima-facie* stood firmly behind them. An awaited offensive had already been launched with the support of the people of Pakistan to make it a better place to live in. The successive news of their success has been pouring in. The entire nation had committed to fully defend their motherland and to stand with their soldiers who have been giving and would continue to offer sacrifices.

Suddenly, it began when the national media and then the international media started covering the events at and around the Idara Mihaj-ul-Quran showing the "TAMASHA" staged since mid-night by the Punjab police contingents mainly came from more than 12 Police Stations of Lahore.

In fact a meeting had already taken place a day before at the Civil Secretariat, Chaired by the then Law Minister, Rna

Sannah Ullah wherein the return of Dr Tahir ul Oadri on 23-6-2014 and his long march from Islamabad to Lahore was discussed in view of the the concerned reports submitted by the special branch, Pujab Police. Despite the reservations shown by the commissioner Lahore about the timing and without participation/discussion by the Mr. Shafiq Gujjar, the then C.C.P.O., Lahore, and Dr.Taugeer Shah, the then Secretary to Chief Minister, Punjab, the Chair firmly decided to remove the barriers around the Idara. The later two, in all fairness, consented to the decision. According to the Chief Minister, he came to know about the "stand-off" at 9.00 am in the morning through the T.V and about the decision from his then Secretary, thereafter, he immediately passed the verbal order to "dis-engage" which was statedly communicated to the law minister by 10.00 am. Meanwhile, the C.M. went to the Governor House at 10.30 am to attend the oath taking ceremony of the newly appointed Chief Justice, Lahore High Court, Lahore, Honourable Justice Khawaja Imtiaz Ahmed and from there at about 11.00 am he straight went to his Model

Town residence to attend his meeting with the Foreign delegates. Until 1.00 pm he did not enquire about the situation at the Idara to know as to whether his order of disengagement was executed.

On the ground the standoff continued the whole night resulting into minor injuries of the police constables as well as the PAT workers. It was after 9.00 am that the DIG operation arrived at the site who called the SPs of different divisions of Lahore and as a result the policemen started increasing in response to the swelling up of the PAT activists. The aggression by the police outclassed the aggression shown by the PAT workers. At 11.00 am DIG convened on spot meeting in which decision was made to call the Elite Force and then move forward towards the Idara. There are both video clippings as well as snaps showing the direct fire shots towards the PAT activists. At about 12.00 the dead bodies as well as injured started coming to the Jinnah Hospital. At about 1.30 p.m the barriers were removed from and around the Idara. The police reported 9 deaths and 54 injured at the time.

CONCLUSIONS

In the said meeting dated 16-6-2017 held under the chairmanship of the former Punjab Minister for Parliamentary Affairs, Local Government & Community Affairs, Rana Sanna Ullah ,and attended by Chief Secretary, Secretary to Chief Minister, Home Secretary Punjab, Commissioner Lahore, C.C.P.O Lahore, Representative of Special Branch in which the later gave the source reports which came under discussion in the milieu of violations, ouster of the Government, system, and bringing in the revolution on account of return of Dr Tahirul-Qadri and his call to hold a long march from Rawalpindi to Lahore On 23 of June 2014. The then law Minister, Rana Sanna Ullah, had the strong point of view who decided not to allow Dr Qadri to take any opportunity to full fill his objective. As the Commissioner Lahore submitted the report about illegalities in placing the barriers and its erections on the roads which were considered and treated as encroachments

around Idara Minhaj-ul-Quran, therefore, the chair decided to remove them with immediate effect. Dr. Tauqeer Shah also consented on behalf of the Chief Minister, Punjab, for the removal of the barriers. It also came on the surface that the participants were in knowledge of the orders passed by Lahore High Court in I.C.A NO.155/2011 and no legal opinion from Advocate General Punjab was sought prior to the decision to start the operation. Such facts and circumstances under which the meeting was held lead to the most unfortunate incident in the history of Pakistan.

According to D.C.O, Lahore, on public complaints, the staff of T.M.A Gulberg Town and T.M.As of Zone II reached the spot in the mid night of 16 June for removing the encroachments. The furious mob and sympathizers mainly young men commenced pelting stones on police. The police as retaliatory measure resorted to firing towards the protestors leaving many persons injured at the site of the incident and some of whom succumbed to their injuries afterward. (report from a security agency). Admittedly, such a level of offensive by

police by any stretch of imagination did not commensurate with the level of resistance by unarmed PAT workers. Again such were the facts and circumstances under which 14 persons have been shot on the vital parts of their bodies.

The level of co-operation in digging out the truth is that no police official from top to bottom, whether actively participated in the operation or not, did utter a single word about the person under whose command the police resorted to firing upon the PAT workers. Understandably, all were in unison in withholding the information from this Tribunal. Unfortunately, such are the facts and circumstances in which they continued to proceed.

To deal suchlike situation ,under the law, a proviso was added to section 128 of the Code of Criminal Procedure, 1898, according to which firing is to be ordered only under the specific directions of an officer of the police not below the rank of an Assistant Superintendent or Deputy Superintendent of Police. The Tribunal, therefore, remained conscious of the deliberate silence and concealment of facts by police

officials/officers before this Tribunal, creating circumstances to think that the police had to abide by the command announced secretly (or openly) to achieve the target at the cost of even killing the unarmed but precious citizens of Pakistan. This led the tribunal to say that this motif of betrayal of law by the police aimed to bury the truth speaks volumes of their high handedness.

In future, to avoid such like situation it is imperative that legislative reforms be brought in to empower the magistrate to pass the order for releasing fire by the police so that the responsibility can be fixed after ascertaining facts and circumstances.

This tribunal would not restrain itself in expressing that the act of the Government not to empower this tribunal under section 11 of Punjab Tribunals Ordinance, 1959 regarding investigation of any matter coming before it is also a bad one, which this tribunal considers as the circumstances to circumvent the process of digging out the truth. The entire gamut of facts and circumstances speak volumes that there

was no good intention of the Government to arrive at a definite and truthful result.

The Tribunal in exercise of its powers requisitioned the information from Federal Government about the reasons for replacement of I.G Punjab and as per report submitted by Secretary Establishment it was in the fallout of Zarb-e-Azab in Punjab. This tribunal views it as insufficient factor since the then IGP, namely, Khan Baig was not reportedly inefficient to manage or tackle the perceived or unknown threats in the province. Similarly, D.C.O Lahore was also changed just before the blood-bath. Such facts and circumstances obviously lead to an adverse opinion.

The day (17-6-2014) and time (between 10.30 am to 12.00 pm) both are very vital as I.G Punjab did not practically take over the command of Punjab Police and at the same time the Honourable new Chief justice was about to take oath. Had this Tribunal been empowered to investigate, the hidden truth might have been exposed. The Chief Minister Punjab in his affidavit took a specific position that on June 17th, 2014 his

official engagement was started after about 9.00 am when he proceeded to Governor House to attend the oath taking ceremony of new Chief Justice of Lahore High Court. According to him having seen the standoff at 9.30 am on TV he immediately contacted his Secretary, Dr. Tauqir Hussain Shah, on phone to order the police to disengage forthwith. Dr. Taugir Hussain Shah in his affidavit did mention the order of disengagement, telephonically conveyed to the Law Minister and Home Secretary, but in turn they informed that two field officers informed that the situation was likely to be normalized/controlled. Strange enough that Rana Sana-Ullah did not utter a single word about "disengagement". Likewise, the Home Secretary, Punjab did not mention in his report about the word "disengagement" but he indicated something in the following manner and style:

"During this period I also received a call from the Secretary to CM who conveyed the CM's concern regarding the ongoing stand-off and said that matter should be resolved peacefully. I informed him that DCO and DIG operations were on-site and trying to resolve the matter peacefully."

Such facts and circumstances are bound to draw adverse inference. The collected reports from all concerned and the affidavits submitted by the police officers in the field do not depict that any order of "disengagement" by the Chief Minister , Punjab ,was ever conveyed/received. It is shocking to note that everyone has deliberately but unsuccessfully tried to cover each other from possible adverse legal effects. This tribunal has very carefully seen the CD of the first press conference of Chief Minister, Punjab, dt;17-6-2014 after the incident in which he did not specifically mention about his direction of "disengagement", despite taking a notice of it in the morning. The record does not reveal its activation, effective communication, implementation, execution or follow up showing that the order, if any, may have been passed listlessly. While putting all the facts and the circumstances in juxtapositions, it has become crystal clear that order of disengagement was not passed at all, rather position taken by C.M. Punjab appears to be an afterthought defense taken before the nation in the press conference.

This Tribunal has also painfully noticed the attitude of the Government and its functionaries towards the orders passed by the High Court wherein ICA No. 155/11 dated 19-5-2011 wherein upon the assurance given by not less than SP (Operations), Model Town, the security barriers were installed to dissatisfaction of both inhabitants of the locality and the police which continued uninterruptedly and without any complaint from any quarter for more than three years, suddenly it was altogether ignored without contemplating the disastrous consequences. The operation planned and designed under the chairmanship of the then Law Minister resulted into gruesome killings could have easily been avoided. The orders passed by the courts such like the one under discussion, it is advised as well as warned, must be complied with in its letter and spirit to avoid such like incidents in future.

In criminology, it is a golden principle for assessment of evidence that man can tell a lie but circumstances don't. The facts and circumstances of the bloodbath clearly show that the police officers actively participated in the massacre. The apathy and recklessness of all authorities in Punjab in the matter under hand, created the genuine doubt about their innocence. As no offence can go unchecked, therefore, even registration of more than one FIR shall not perpetuate injustice as the version put forward by the PAT leader, namely, Muhammad Jawad Hamid, Director, Administration, Minhajul-Quran International, does not appear to be an amplification of the version of the first FIR on the subject.

The actions of Police of firing and severely beating the people on the crime scene is irrefutably suggestive that the police did exactly for which they were sent and gathered over there. The police and all other concerned, without any exception, abetted being desperado, performed daredevil acts, which resulted into irreparable loss.

Keeping in view the above facts and circumstances the reader of this report can easily fix the responsibility of the unfortunate Minhaj-ul-Quran incident.

After having concluded as above this Tribunal is especially thankful to the media in general to inculcate the confidence of the public in the proceedings notwithstanding the unnecessary boycott by the PAT leadership. The valuable suggestion from the participants came as a beacon light for this Tribunal. The Liaison Officer of Govt. of Punjab namely Assad Ullah Faiz, Additional Secretary, Home Department also helped this Tribunal for effective and prompt correspondence. The two Registrars, namely, Mr. Jawad-ul-Hassan, Disrtict & Sessions Judge and Mr. Sadiq Masood Sabir, Addl. Distt. & Sessions Judge and other members worked day and night as a result of which this Tribunal is able to send its report at a very crucial time.

(ALI BAQAŘ NAJAFI)

JUDGE/
TRIBUNAL OF INQUIRY

It is certified that this report comprising 74 pages, has been typed and signed by me.

(ALI BAQAR NAJAFI)

JUDGE/

TRIBUNAL OF INQUIRY

ORDER SHEET

INQUIRY_INTO_THE_INCIDENT_AT_MINHAJ-UI-QURAN ACADEMY_AND_SECRETARRIAT_IN_MODEL_TOWN, LAHORE_

18.06.2014. On account of gory incident which took place at Minhaj-ul-Quran Academy and Secretariat situated in Model Town. Lahore, causing loss of lives creating unrest in the general public and attracted the attention of the local and international media. The Punjab has constituted the Tribunal of Inquiry under the Punjab Tribunals of Inquiry Ordinance, 1969 (II of 1969) through Notification No.SO(Judl-III) 9-53/2014 dated 17.06.2014 issued by the Government of the Punjab. Home Department, Lahore with the following terms:

"To ascertain the facts and circumstances of the incident at Minhaj-ul-Quran Academy and Secretariat in Model Town, Lahore."

- 2. This Tribunal was constituted u/s 3 of the Punjab Tribunals of Inquiry Ordinance, 1969 (to be referred as Ordinance). Under section 8 of the Ordinance, this Tribunal has the power to regulate its own procedure including the fixing of places and time of sitting. In addition to this Tribunal has the authority to decide whether to sit in public or in private. For the purposes of carrying out the proceedings of the Tribunal, Mr Jawad-ul-Hassan D&SJ Staff Officer to Honourable Chief Justice, Lahore High Court, Lahore, is appointed as Registrar of this Tribunal u/s 10 of the Ordinance (hereinafter be called as Registrar). The Registrar is directed to set up the Secretariat of Tribunal consisting of following persons:
 - Mr. Jamshed Akhtar Shaheen, Private Secretary/ Incharge Complaint Cell, as Assistant to Registrar.
 - Mr. Muhammad Din, Personal Assistant, as Staff Officer to the Tribunal.
 - Mr. Samuel Javed, Private Secretary, as Private Secretary to the Tribunal.
 - Mr. Ghulam Yasin, Private Secretary as Additional Private Secretary to the Tribunal.

Order Sheet

Mr. Shahzad Khalid, Personal Assistant as Additional Private Secretary to the Tribuanl.

- 6. Mr. Javed Iqbal, Court Associate, as Custodian of record
- Mr. Muhammad Naeem, Naib Qasid, as Naib Qasid to the Tribunal
- Mr. Muhammad Azeem Badar, Naib Qasid, as Naib Qasid to the Tribunal.
- 3. The Registrar is further directed to ask the Secretary, Government of the Punjab, Home Department, Lahore for issuance of notification regarding the conferment of additional powers us 5 of the Punjab Iribunals of Inquiry Ordinance, 1969 (II of 1969) and the appointment of a focal person, not below the rank of Deputy Secretary. The Registrar is also directed to inform the general public through publication in leading national newspapers both of English and Urdu as well as electronic media accordingly.
- 4. The Tribunal will commence its inquiry proceedings at the Principal Seat of Lahore High Court, Lahore, Judges Library, New Wing, on 19.06,2014 at 2:00 pm. It is further directed that any person desirous of making submissions before the Tribunal, may appear before the Tribunal with the prior registration of his name with the Registrar of the Tribunal. Such persons can file written submissions along with the relevant documents (if any) with the copy of CNIC along with duly sworn affidavits, Meanwhile, the Inspector General of Police, Punjab, District Coordination Officer, Lahore and Director General LDA shall appear in person and submit a detailed report of the incident at the above-said time.

(ALI BAQAR NAJAFI) JUDGE, LAHORE HIGH COURT LAHORE/ INQUIRY TRIBUNAL

Notification No.SO(Judicial-III) 9-53/2014 dated 17.06.2014 is silent about the additional powers u/s 5 of the Punjab Tribunals of Inquiry Ordinance, 1969 as to order a police investigation into any matter coming before it. The Registrar of this Tribunal is directed to ask the Government of the Punjab for conferment of such additional powers to this Tribunal.

Tribunal 18.06.2014

MOST URGENT

LAHORE HIGH COURT, LAHORE

No. 02 dated 18,06,2014

From

The Registrar, Tribunal of Inquiry (Mmhaj-ul-Quran incident) Lahore.

To

The Secretary, Government of the Punjab, Home Department, Lahore.

Subject:

CONFERMENT OF ADDITIONAL POWERS U/S 5 OF THE PUNJAB TRIBUNAL OF INQUIRY ORDINANCE, 1969

Dear Sir,

I am directed to convey that the Hon'ble Mr. Justice Ali Bagar Najaji/Tribunal of Inquiry (Minhaj-ul-Quran Academy incident) has been pleased to direct that it be brought to your notice that Notification No.SO(Judl-III) 9-53/2014 dated 17.06.2014 is silent about the additional powers $u/s\ 5$ of the Punjab Tribunal of Inquiry Ordinance, 1969.

It is, therefore, desired that separate and distinct/ revised Notification be issued in terms of Section 5 of the Punjab Tribunals of Inquiry Ordinance, 1969, immediately so that the work of the Tribunal may be undertaken.

Yours faithfully,

(Jawad-ul-Hassan) Registrar Tribunal of Inquiry

No. 02 dated 18.06.2014.

Copy to:

- Staff Officer to the Principal Secretary to the Chief Minister, Punjab,
- 2. Staff Officer to the Chief Secretary, Government of the Punjab, Lahore.
- 3. Staff Officer to the Registrar, Lahore High Court, Lahore

(Jawad-ul-Hassan) Registrar Tribunal of Inquiry

19.06.2014

Mr. Mushtaq Ahmad Sukhera, Inspector General of Police,

Punjab in person.

Mr. Ahad Khan Cheema, D.G. L.D.A in person.

Captain (R) Muhammad Usman D.C.O, Lahore in person.

Mr. Aftab Ahmad Bajwa, Advocate in person.

Mr. Abdullah Malik in person

MS. Shabnam Nagi, Advocate in person.

Rana Ijaz Ahmad Khan, Advocate in person.

Mr. Waseem Shahabi, Advocate in person.

Malik Saleem Murshad Advocate in person.

At the very outset Mr. Aftab Ahmad Bajwa, Advocate stood up and filed before this Tribunal an application with affidavit and vehemently divulged that the previous Judicial Commissions constituted in the manner of this Commission remained fruitless as reports formulated and the recommendations made by the concerned Judicial Commissions such as on flood, drugs etc. could not get any useful result. The Government deliberately with ulterior motive put all the previous recommendations and reports in cold storage rendering them useless. He stated that the Governments in such like incidents always actually continue to fudge the issue by sending the matter to the Judicial Tribunals. The said previous reports of Judicial Commissions are still dormant; therefore, this Tribunal should withdraw from the proceedings commenced in pursuance of the Notification of Constitution of this Tribunal. He added that the Government of Punjab deliberately in order to cover up their misdeed constituted this Tribunal with ulterior motive. He vehemently suggested that he should be provided the relevant law, rules and Authority of this Tribunal under which the proceedings are being undertaken. The application submitted by him will be considered on the next date.

2. After recording the contention and version of Mr. Aftab Ahmad Bajwa, Advocate I.G.P, Punjab was directed to submit his report as per order. The report has been submitted by the Inspector General of Police, Punjab, Lahore. Having submitted his report he disclosed that due to paucity of time could not prepare the complete report, however, the senior police officers are preparing the report. At this juncture I.G.P present before Tribunal is further directed to submit the record of the FIRs of the unfortunate gory incident alongwith complete record of

investigation carried out till date. He will regularly submit the report regarding the progress of the investigation every day till furthers orders. He shall also submit the names of the police personnel armed or unarmed stationed at Minhaj-ul-Quran secretariat on the day of said incident with specific names, designations, describing their duties and also containing the names of the authorities who were responsible to assign the duties to such stationed police personnel.

- 3. Mr. Ahmad Khan Cheema, D.G. L.D.A, Lahore has not submitted his reply. He stated that he has no concern with the episode. He was directed to comply with the order of this Tribunal without and submit his report today. He shall also provide the proceeding of the meeting if any, held between him, I.G, Punjab, C.C.P.O, Lahore, D.I.G, Operation and D.C.O, Lahore for the purpose of carrying out the operation. The D.C.O, Lahore and D.G. L.D.A both are also directed to give their detailed reports separately and independently about the barriers placed near and around the Minhaj-ul-Quran secretariat. Both are further directed to place on record the order of competent authority and the judgment if any whereby the permission was accorded to the Minhaj-ul-Quran Secretariat for installing the barriers and other measure of safety. D.CO and D.G, L.D.A alongwith their reports shall append the copies of correspondence with the administration of the Minhaj-ul-Quran secretariat which will include the notices, show cause notices, intimations of any kind regarding the removal of barriers and correspondence addressed to all concerned for commencement of operation for the removal of the obstacles. The D.C.O and D.G. L.D.A shall report regarding steps taken by them for the accomplishment of operation on the site. The needful be done by tomorrow.
- 4. Mr. Abdullah Malik, President Civil Society Network, resident of 50, Lawrence Road, Lahore has suggested the Tribunal to collect all available record pertaining to the incident, and also collect the reports of electronic and print media as well as social media. He has also suggested that the concerned authorities be directed to procure the conversation took place on mobile phones between Ministers, I.G.P, D.G, L.D.A, C.C.P.O, D.I.Gs, D.C.O and all other concerned authorities and

officials who participated in the gory operation supported by their selfstyled affidavits. He urged the Tribunal to issue appropriate direction to the concerned authorities for the preservation of the mobile phone conversation record. He added that the compensation of destroyed vehicles during the operation may be given to the aggrieved owners.

- 5. Mrs. Shabnam Nagi, Advocate, Chairman Interfaith Dialogue has suggested that immediately after the incident certain persons disappeared, therefore, their record may also be summoned. He has also suggested that the medical reports, post-mortem-reports and other reports are being tampered with, which should be protected.
- Mr. Rana Ijaz Ahmad Khan, Advocate, Chairman Human Rights has suggested that those persons who are on police remand are not being allowed to see either their lawyers or their relatives. He told the Tribunal that he has talked to the son of the Chairman Awami Tehrik, Dr. Tahirul Qadri namely, Hassan Mohy-ud-Din who informed that as per his information some persons injured at the hands of police, and some dead bodies, have been concealed and made them disappear by the police authorities maliciously with ulterior motive just to minimize the gravity of the incident.
- 7. Malik Saleem Murshid, Advocate appeared and suggested that the shops keepers/venders of market in the vicinity where the occurrence took place had been detained by the police officials who were not being released so for, therefore, they may be released immediately as they are not required in any criminal case. Further stated that nearby market where many venders lost their valuables during the clash as reported in the media, should adequately and substantially be compensated.
- 8. To come up for submission of required reports and further proceedings tomorrow at 2.00 p.m or at any time subsequently to 2.00 p.m. Meanwhile, the Tribunal may visit the vicinity of the Minhaj-ul-Quran, Secretariat.

TRIBUNAL

19.06.2014 Mr. Ahad Khan Cheema, D.G. L.D.A. in person **08:55 pm.**

He has submitted a report of one page. The report submitted by him be made part of the record.

- To a question D.G. L.D.A stated that to his knowledge no notice, show cause notice or correspondence made or sent to Minhaj-ul-Quran Secretariat for the removal of encroachments. He voluntarily stated that L.D.A did not take part in the operation under question that the area lying under the building is under control authority of L.D.A. He was put a question by the Tribunal whether he wants to supplement any thing to his report filed today but he frankly stated that D.C.O, Lahore in his report made all the points clear.
- 3. The Tribunal and its Registrar today made a visit of the area at Mughrab time where the unfortunate incident took place. In the said visit the Secretariat of Minhaj-ul-Quran was also visited from inside and outside. The said visit lasted about one hour and 45 minutes.
- 4. File be put up as per previous order recorded today.

TRIBUNAL

20.06.2014

Nemo for Mr. Mushtaq Ahmad Sukhera, Inspector General of Police, Punjab.

Captain (R) Muhammad Usman D.C.O, Lahore in person.

Mr. Aftab Ahmad Bajwa, Advocate in person.

Mr. Abdullah Malik,in person

Rana Ijaz Ahmad Khan, Advocate.

Ms. Shabnam Aslam Nagi, .Advocate.

Malik Sohail Murshad Advocate.

The Inspector General of Police, Punjab was required to appear in person again, but it is regretted that neither the reports as desired by this Tribunal nor his person is present today.

- 2. The IGP, Punjab has entered appearance at 2:45 pm and has tendered a report in pursuance of order passed by this Tribunal alongwith annexures which has been made part of the record.
- 3. In today's participation Mr. M. Tanvir Chaudhry, Advocate suggested that the recording of FIRs against the culprits who were shown in national as well as international media for looting and destruction of the private property was booked for offences of lesser gravity instead of 7-Anti-Terrorism Act, 1997. Mr. Sohail Murshid, Advocate suggested that those who are still detained by the police should be named before this Tribunal. Muhammad Nawaz Kharal, Advocate has suggested that according to the media reports 15/20 persons have died and main aggrieved persons are the workers of the Pakistan Awami Tahrik (PAT) who neither been summoned nor being invited to formally participate in these proceedings. Mr. Qaisar Imtiaz Mughal, Advocate has pointed out that the Government is trying to justify the occurrence and in this respect he has specifically given reference to statements of the Law Minister, Rana Sanaullah. Mr. Aftab Ahmad Bajwa, Advocate has again pointed out that the necessary document have not been provided to him. He has forcefully suggested that in order to win the confidence of the aggrieved party, a joint investigation team be constituted. He has also suggested that in this behalf any application moved by

them for the registration of the FIR be properly and legally responded, as in his opinion, second F.I.R can be registered. Mr. Abdullah Malik, has suggested that in order to enhance the sanctity of this Tribunal intelligence reports, if necessary, may also be called. It was also pointed out that many complaints were raised against the Punjab Police for conducting extrajudicial killings for the period of last five years, therefore, its record be also taken into consideration by this Tribunal. Mr. Muhammad Sajjad Naeem, Advocate has suggested that the medico-legal reports of those already injured and of those who have recently been brought to the hospital may also be made public to expose the level of torture the police have perpetrated against them. Rana Ijaz Ahmad Khan, Advocate has suggested that the copies of reports of the police and other officials be provided to him since it has been made part of the record.

4. To make further advancement in the proceedings of this Tribunal and keeping in view the suggestions given today it is appropriate that Secretary Information and culture Department be issued a direction to provide all newspaper clippings, footages and newsreels appearing in the electronic media relevant to the bloodbath of the gory incident, be produced before this Tribunal. It is also deemed feasible that administration of the private TV channels who are essentially required to provide the relevant material i.e. footages, newsreels, CDs of the films recorded by their cameramen during the operation of removal of barriers installed near and around the Minhaj-ul-Quran Secretariat, Model Town, Lahore be provided to be watched by this Tribunal. addition to this all electronic media people are invited to assist this Tribunal to ascertain the facts and circumstances under inquiry. This invitation to media people be issued through press release by the PRO attached with this Tribunal. This Tribunal would feel much satisfied if the statements of the media people

on the subject are also recorded. The following TV channels be invited to produce all the relevant material:-

"AAJ TV, DUNYA TV, EXPRESS NEWS, ARY NEWS, SAMMA TV, NEWS-ONE, DAWN, WAQAT, CNBC, CITY-42, CHANNEL-5, VALUE TV, ROYAL TV, KOH-I-NOOR TV, CAPITAL TV, ABTAK TV, JAAG, DIN T.V."

- 5. During the proceedings it has been pointed out time and again that since no formal invitation was issued to the Secretariat of Minhaj-ul-Quran for their valuable suggestions or giving any statement before this Tribunal, therefore, they be also send a request to kindly convey their point of view and give evidence before this Tribunal which is entrusted with the responsibility of holding the inquiry and to ascertain the facts and circumstances for the unfortunate incident. Besides any one desirous of giving any evidence or making any oral or written statement in the form of duly sworn affidavit may appear before this Tribunal.
- 6. The proceedings of the Tribunal are adjourned for tomorrow (21.06.2014) at 2:00 pm.

TRIBUNAL

Notification No.SO(Judicial-III) 9-53/2014 dated 17.06.2014 is silent about the conferment of powers u/s 11 of the Punjab Tribunals of Inquiry Ordinance, 1969 as to order a police investigation into any matter coming before it. The Registrar of this Tribunal is directed to ask the Government of the Punjab for such conferment of powers to this Tribunal.

Tribunal 20.06.2014

MOST URGENT

LAHORE HIGH COURT, LAHORE

No. 9/76 I dated 20.06.2014

From

The Registrar, Tribunal of Inquiry (Minhaj-ul-Quran incident) Lahore.

The Secretary, Government of the Punjab, Home Department, Lahore.

Subject:

CONFERMENT OF ADDITIONAL POWERS U/S 11 OF THE PUNJAB TRIBUNAL OF INQUIRY ORDINANCE, 1969

Dear Sir,

I am directed to convey that the Hon'ble Mr. Justice Ali Bagar Najafi/Tribunul of Inquiry (Minhaj-ul-Quran Academy incident) has been pleased to direct that it be brought to your notice that Notification No.SO(Judl-III), 9-53/2014 dated 17.06.2014 is silent about the conferment of powers u/s 11 of the Punjab Tribunals of Inquiry Ordinance, 1969 as to order a police investigation into any matter coming before it.

It is, therefore, desired that separate and distinct/ revised Notification be issued in terms of Section 11 of the Punjab Tribunals of Inquiry Ordinance, 1969, immediately so that the work of the Tribunal may be undertaken.

Yours faithfully,

(Jawad-u1-Hassan) Registrar Tribunal of Inquiry

10 to 12/ToI No.______dated 20.06.2014.

Copy to:

- 1. Staff Officer to the Principal Secretary to the Chief Minister, Punjab,
- 2. Staff Officer to the Chief Secretary, Government of the Punjab, Lahore.
- 3. Staff Officer to the Registrar, Lahore High Court, Lahore

Registrar Tribunal of Inquiry

21.06.2014 Mr. Mushtaq Ahmad Sukhera, Inspector General of

Police, Punjab.
Mr. Momin Agha, Secretary, Government of the Punjab,
Information and Culture Department.
Ms. Shabnam Aslam Nagi, Advocate.
Mr.M. Tanvir Chaudhry, Advocate.

In today's proceedings some valuable suggestions were given which include the constitution of a Joint Investigation Team and disbursing of the funds of the Bait-ul-mall Punjab to the affectees of the incident, any progress on the application for registration of another FIR of the unfortunate incident and many others. It was also suggested that the participation of the affectees is not forthcoming. It was also pointed out that former Law Minister Government of the Punjab and the former Principal Secretary to the Chief Minister Punjab who were made to guit be also summoned to record their statements. The participation was done by M/s Imran Manget, Ahmad Tanvir Chaudhry, Shabnam Aslam Nagi, Rai K.P. Waseem, Rana Asif Ali, Aamir Saeed and Magsood Raza, Advocates. M/s M. Tanveer Chaudhry, of Insaf Law Company, Mukhtar Hussain Gondal and Imran Manget, Advocates have filed application, the same be placed on the record.

- 2. It is noticed that D.C.O, Lahore is not present before this Tribunal who was not only ordered to be present in person but was also ordered to submit the report on the previous dates of hearing. Daily progress report regarding the investigation of the incident was required by this Tribunal from the Inspector General Police, Punjab. He is reminded that the said report is to be submitted on daily basis without fail, otherwise, an adverse inference may be drawn.
- 3. In view of the discussions/suggestions made before this Tribunal it is appropriate that a report be requisitioned from the

Secretary, Government of the Punjab, Home Department, regarding the possibility of constitution of a Joint Investigation Team on the unfortunate incident. The Secretary, Bait-ul-mal, Punjab, Lahore may also be directed to appear in person to abreast this Tribunal about the possibility of payment of any kind of compensation to the effectees. This Tribunal also feels appropriate that the Secretary, Government of the Punjab, Health Department will also appear in person before this Tribunal with the autopsy reports of deceased persons and those who were seriously injured in the unfortunate incident. This Tribunal also deems it appropriate that in view of the recent developments, the former law Minister namely Rana Sanaullah and the former Principal Secretary to the Chief Minister Punjab namely Dr. Tauqir Shah shall be served through Secretary Law and Secretary Home Departments, Government of the Punjab to appear in person before this Tribunal on the next date of hearing.

4. The proceedings of the Tribunal are adjourned for Monday (23.06.2014) at 2:00 pm.

(ALI BAQAR NAJAFI) TRIBUNAL **23.06.2014** of

Mr. Asad Ullah Faiz, Additional Home Secretary, Government

the Punjab, Lahore in person.

Captain (R) Muhammad Usman, D.C.O, Lahore in person. Captain (R) Jehanzaib Khan, Secretary Social Welfare and Baitulmal, Lahore in person.

Dr. Ijaz Munir, Secretary Health, Government of the Punjab, Lahore in person.

Mr. Azam Nazir Tarar, Advocate on behalf of Rana Sanaullah, former Law Minister.

Mr. Qasim Ali Chohan, Advocate on behalf of Dr. Tauqir Shah, former Principal Secretary to Chief Minister, Punjab.

Ms. Shabnam Aslam Nagi, Advocate.

Mr.M. Tanvir Chaudhry, Advocate.

Malik Sohail Murshid, Advocate

Muhammad Nadeem, SP (Investigation), Model Town,

Lahore

A report has been submitted on behalf of the Home Secretary, Government of the Punjab, Lahore stating that Joint Investigation Team has been constituted in which the names of some of the members have been mentioned. The Secretary, Social Welfare and Baitulmall has stated that, although, there is no specific head for disbursement of the compensation to the affectees of the incident, like one under probe, but the DCO, Lahore has placed on record the photocopies of the cheques issued in the names of legal heirs of nine deceased persons each for Rs.3-million. The Secretary Health, Government of the Punjab has submitted a report regarding the medico-legal reports of the injured and the autopsy reports of the deceased, which has been read before this Tribunal, in terms of the number of injured and the deceased. One News Channel, namely Koh-i-Noor T.V has also tendered a copy of the CD of the incident. All have been made part of the record. A suggestion/information came that one deceased Muhammad Iqbal's son (name not known) is missing and has not been traced out so far. Muhammad Nadeem, SP (Investigation), Model Town, Lahore is present who is directed to trace him out and give a report before this Tribunal on the next date of hearing.

Many valuable suggestions were made during the proceedings including the specific time for the recording of evidence of the eyewitnesses. However, it is observed that an advertisement has already been circulated in the news, both in electronic and print media in which the eye witnesses or anybody who has any information about the incident is welcomed before this Tribunal. Obviously, this Tribunal is not for an indefinite period and would like to conclude its proceedings as early as possible. It was also suggested that the Chief Secretary, Government of the Punjab, Lahore should also submit a report regarding the circumstances in which the new IGP was posted, the DCO, Lahore was changed and other changes in the bureaucracy were made.

- In this view of the matter, this Tribunal deems it appropriate that the Chief Secretary, Government of the Punjab, be directed to appear before this Tribunal and submit the report regarding the facts and circumstances for such changes of the key postings in Lahore and the Province of Punjab. The daily report on behalf of the IGP has been submitted which has been made as part of record. He has made a written request for the exemption of his appearance on account of law and order situation prevailing in the city of Lahore. His exemption is granted for today. This Tribunal has also received two written applications on behalf of former Law Minister Punjab, Rana Sanaullah and by Dr. Taugir Shah, Former Principal Secretary to Chief Minister Punjab, for their exemption from appearance for today on account of prevailing law and order situation. These two applications are also allowed and said persons are granted exemption for today.
- 3. This Tribunal is now adjourned to 26.06.2014 at 2:00 pm.

(ALI BAQAR NAJAFI) TRIBUNAL

<u>ORDER</u>

Since the Tribunal has established the official email address, therefore, the same will be publicized in print and electronic media, enabling the general public and any person desiring to give any relevant information, material, evidence, connected with the incident of Minhaj-ul-Quran Academy and Secretariat, for the sake of justice and in public interest. Through the public notice the Secretariat of Minhaj-ul-Quran, Model Town, Lahore be also informed that they can also send information, and material of evidence, of gory incident/bloodbath to this Tribunal through the official email address or other means. However, irrelevant material will not be taken into account and will be rejected.

TRIBUNAL 25.06.2014

26.06.2014 Mr. Naveed Akram Cheema, Chief Secretary, Government of Punjab, Lahore

Mr. Asad Ullah Faiz, Additional Home Secretary, Government of the Punjab, Lahore.

Captain (R) Muhammad Usman, D.C.O, Lahore.

Mr. Qasim Ali Chohan, Advocate with Dr. Tauqir Shah, former Principal Secretary to Chief Minister, Punjab.

Mr. Shafqat Chohan, Advocate/President, Lahore High Court, Bar Association.

Ms. Shabnam Aslam Nagi, Advocate.

Rana Sana Ullah, former Law Minister, Punjab, Lahore.

Mr. Naseer Ahmad Bhutta, Advocate Supreme Court of

Pakistan (in personal capacity)

Mr. Tanvir Chaudhry, Advocate.

Syed Muhammad Iqtidar Haider, in person.

Rana Athar Farooq, Advocate.

Mr. Ahmad Chachar, Advocate/General Secretary, LHBA.

Malik Nazar Farid Khokhar, Advocate.

Mr. Kashif Mehmood Sulemani, Advocate.

Mr. Abdullah Malik, President Civil Society Network.

Today C.D's on behalf of the Waqat T.V and Dunya T.V have been tendered by Abdur Rehman and M. Ashfaq, reporters respectively. Capital T.V presented a footage which has also been made part of the record. A suggestion has been given in writing by Mrs. Shabnam Aslam Nagi Advocate requiring the Tribunal to summon the injured witnesses who were either discharged by the Hospital or still under treatment. Another suggestion was made by her to summon the Chief Minister, Punjab, the former Inspector General of Police Punjab, Lahore and former D.C.O, Lahore. Her application has also been made part of the record. Certified copies of the petitions under section 22-A and 22-B, Cr.P.C alongwith photo copies of press clippings filed by Mr. Kashif Mehmood Sulemani, Advocate, which is placed on the record. Rana Athar Faroog Advocate has put an application before the Tribunal to determine the status of Minhaj-ul-Quran, Academy and Secretariat and disbursement of its funds. The application shall also be made part of the record and an appropriate order will be passed. One Syed M. Iqtidar Haider has placed on record an application alongwith photocopy of the article published in Nawa-e-Waqat dated 21.06.2014 and copy of the judgment reported in PLJ 1999 Lahore 801.

- 2. In today's discussion, the President Bar Association of Lahore High Court, Lahore and General Secretary also participated and gave very valuable suggestions while reposing full confidence in the Tribunal and resolved to defend the sanctity of the Tribunal at all costs. Mr. Naseer Ahmad Bhutta, Advocate Supreme Court has also supported the proceedings being conducted by this Tribunal.
- Mr. Mushtaq Ahmad Sukhera, Inspector General of Police Punjab, Lahore has requested for his exemption before this Tribunal with an undertaking to appear whenever required by this Tribunal. Since the Inspector General of Police is occupying a very important position in the Province, but top police representation is also required before this Tribunal, therefore, it is ordered that he may attend to his other duties but he is directed to depute some other responsible officer of equal status and competency to attend the proceedings of this Tribunal. He shall appear before this Tribunal whenever so required. A report has been submitted through the Inspector General of Police, Punjab Lahore stating that son of Muhammad Igbal deceased namely Asif Igbal was detained and later on was released on 22.06.2014. Mr. Abdullah Malik, President Civil Society Network, however, submits that the Commissioner Lahore is relevant person, therefore, his report be also requisitioned. He suggested that the point of view of the aggrieved party should also be brought on record. In this behalf, the suggestion given by Mrs. Shabnam Aslam Naqi, Advocate to the extent that injured persons be summoned is worth consideration. Mr. Tanvir Chaudhry, Advocate has informed the Tribunal that although a joint investigation team was ordered to be constituted but has not been properly constituted so far. He has suggested that the former Inspector General of Police, Punjab Lahore remained at a very important position immediately before the incident, should also be summoned. Mr. Nazar Farid Khokhar, Advocate has suggested that valuable time of the Tribunal should be saved by calling the witnesses and record their statements to move further ahead into the probe. Mr. Ahmad Chachar, Advocate/General Secretary of the Lahore High Court Bar Association Lahore appeared and suggested that whosoever, is willing to give evidence before this Tribunal should be fully protected and he has

further suggested that any learned member of the Bar Association who intends to give suggestion/input should come through the representative of the Lahore High Court Bar Association for the smooth functioning of this Tribunal.

- 4. Keeping in view the discussion held today and the suggestions given before this Tribunal it is appropriate that their separate reports may be requisitioned from the Home Secretary, Government of the Punjab, Commissioner, Lahore and Ex-C.C.P.O, Lahore (Mr. Shafique Ahmad Gujjar) to ascertain the facts and circumstances of the unfortunate incident. They are also directed to appear in person on the next date of hearing.
- 5. Meanwhile, the injured persons/patients who are admitted and shifted to different clinical departments of Jinnah Hospital as a consequence of the incident of Minhaj-ul-Quran, Model Town, Lahore be summoned for recording of their statements before this Tribunal. The process be issued in the name of C.C.P.O, Lahore who is bound to get the service effected and produce the injured witnesses before this Tribunal on 30th of June 2014 at 2.00 p.m. The Medical Officers of Jinnah Hospital, Services Hospital, Sir Ganga Ram, Hospital and General Hospital are also summoned through the Secretary, Health Government of the Punjab, Lahore to appear alongwith attested copies of the complete post-mortem reports of the deceased and medico-legal reports of the injured persons on the said date. The Secretary Health, Government of Punjab will be responsible to produce them alongwith record on the said date i.e 30.06.2014.
- 6. Rana Sana Ullah, Ex-Law Minister and Dr. Tauqir Shah, former Secretary to Chief Minister Punjab are present who sought time to file affidavits. They are directed to file their duly sworn affidavits regarding the facts and circumstances of the incident which took place on 16/17-06.2014 at Minhaj-ul-Quran Academy and Secretariat, Model Town Lahore on 30.06.2014.

(ALI BAQAR NAJAFI) TRIBUNAL **30.06.2014** Mr. Azam Suleman, Home Secretary, Government of the Punjab, Lahore

Mr. Rashid Mahmood, Commissioner, Lahore Division, Lahore

Mr. Muhammad Shafique Gujjar, Ex-CCPO, Lahore

Mr. Qasim Ali Chohan, AAG with Dr. Tauqir Shah, former Principal Secretary to Chief Minister, Punjab.

Mr. Shafqat Chohan, Advocate/President, Lahore High Court, Bar Association.

Mr. Aftab Ahmad Bajwa, Advocate

Ms. Shabnam Aslam Nagi, Advocate. Rana Sana Ullah, former Law Minister, Punjab, Lahore.

Mr. Karama Ali, S.P. Model Town, Lahore

Mian Muhammad Asif, Advocate.

Ch. Waseem Ahmad Chaichi, Advocate

Mr. Abdullah Malik, President Civil Society Network.

Mr. Tariq Aziz, S.P. Model Town, injured police official.

Rizvan Qadir, former SHO, Zishan and Sharif injured

Police officials in person.

Dr. Muzammal Hussain Bhatti, APMO, Jinnah Hospital, Lahore

Dr.Zahid Manzoor, MO, Jinnah Hospital, Lahore.

Dr. Fariha Aslam, CMO, Ganga Ram Hospital, Lahore.

Dr. Shazia Manzoor w/o Dr. Manzoor Ahmad Forensic department AIMC/JHL.

Dr. Asma Mehmood, CMO, Sir Ganga Ram Hospital, Lahore.

the Home Secretary Government of the Punjab Commissioner, Lahore Division, Lahore have submitted their respective reports and they have also read the same before this Tribunal. The former CCPO, Lahore Mr. Shafiq Ahmad has also presented a report which according to him is a sensitive one, therefore, the same has not been read over before the Tribunal. All the said three officials who have appeared before this Tribunal are directed that they may be resummoned for certain queries. Rana Sana Ullah, former Law Minister and Dr. Tauquir Shah, former Secretary to the Chief Minister, Punjab have also submitted their respective sworn affidavits, which have been made part of the record. They were also informed that certain questions may be asked from them for which they may be re-summoned. Mian Muhammad Asif, Advocate son of Mian Iftikhar Ahmad appeared before the Tribunal and stated that his father was critically injured during the unfortunate incident and has recently been discharged from the hospital and he would be able to appear before the Tribunal after about

7/10 days. He is asked to produce him before this Tribunal whenever Mian Iftikhar is in a position to make such a statement. Besides, Rizvan Qadir, former SHO, Zishan, Sharif and Tariq Aziz S.P., injured police officials are present before this Tribunal, who have been absolved for the time being and they may be re-summoned subsequently, as today the doctors who conducted the autopsy of deceased persons, have been asked to record their statements. During the proceedings suggestion came that since the Joint Investigation Team was constituted in response to a report requisitioned by this Tribunal from the Home Secretary, Government of the Punjab, therefore, they should be ordered to submit their reports on regular basis before this Tribunal. Ch. Waseem Ahmad Chaichi, Advocate has also pointed out that the unfortunate incident triggered out for the reason that there was some resistance in dismantling the obstructions around the Idara-Minhaj-ul-Quran, which according to one version was allowed by the order of the Lahore High Court, Lahore. Suffice it to say that this order has neither been presented by the learned counsel before this Tribunal nor by the concerned aggrieved persons, therefore, the aggrieved persons may if so advised may resort to their legal remedies under the law. Mr. Aftab Ahmad Bajwa, Advocate and Mrs Shabnam Aslam Nagi, Advocate have insisted that their applications may be taken up and decided, which will be taken up tomorrow and decided after hearing the arguments. Since the injured have not been properly served, therefore, the C.C.P.O, Lahore is directed to ensure their service and submit the individual report on 3.06.2014.

- 2. Statements of Dr. Muzammal Hussain Bhatti, APMO, Jinnah Hospital, Lahore, Dr.Zahid Manzoor, MO, Jinnah Hospital, Lahore, Dr. Fariha Aslam, CMO, Ganga Ram Hospital, Lahore, Dr. Shazia Manzoor w/o Dr. Manzoor Ahmad Forensic department AIMC/JHL, Dr. Asma Mehmood, CMO, Sir Ganga Ram Hospital, Lahore have been record today. Rest of the statements of the doctors will be recorded tomorrow.
- 3. The proceedings are now adjourned for tomorrow (01.07.2014) at 2:00 pm.

(ALI BAQAR NAJAFI)

TRIBUNAL

01.07.2014 Mr. Qasim Ali Chohan, AAG.

Mr. Aftab Ahmad Bajwa, Advocate on behalf of Mst. Naghmana Yasmeen Social Worker and Ch. Muhammad Arshad.

Ms. Shabnam Aslam Nagi, Advocate.

Mr. Altaf Hussain Additional Inspector General Police, Punjab, Lahore.

Mr. Karamat Ali, S.P. Legal, Lahore.

Dr. Sajjad Karamat, DMLO (IW-6) and Dr. Anwaar Mumtaz, DMLO Forensic Medicine Service, Services Hospital, Lahore.

Mr. Aftab Ahmad Bajwa, Advocate has filed three applications praying the entry of the names of different persons mentioned in the application, in the Exit Control List and also for collecting the record of the activities of their concerned officials between 12.06.2014 to 17.06.2014. He has also read out certain judgments passed by the superior courts of this Country on the registration of second FIR. Mrs. Shabnam Aslam Nagi, Advocate has also suggested that the Inspector General of Police, Punjab may be directed to register a new criminal case in order to ascertain the fact of giving order from or to the police officers to open the fire. The suggestions as well as contents of applications have been noted down which will provide notable points at the time of questioning the persons who have already sworn their affidavits and submitted their reports. This tribunal does not feel it appropriate to either order or not to order for inclusion of the certain persons in the Exit Control List as there is a proper forum available. Needless to say that the law of the land is equal for all whose ignorance is obviously not an excuse. Two witnesses have been presented by Mr. Aftab Ahmad Bajwa, Advocate who have been asked by this Tribunal to give their duly sworn affidavits to further proceed in the matter. It has also been pointed out that certain persons who are willing to appear as witness before this Tribunal are being threatened which is obviously also a concern of this Tribunal. He may give the names of such proposed witnesses and the persons who are advancing threats to them through an information either in the open Court or in the Chamber.

It is appropriate that the Joint Investigation Team which was reportedly constituted is directed to submit its interim report before this Tribunal on 3.07.2014. Meanwhile Mr. Altaf Hussain, Addl.IGP (R & D) has submitted interim report on behalf of the IGP, which is made part of the record. Four CDs have been presented by the Dawn TV, which have been made part of the record. The medical record of 23 injured private persons who were admitted in different clinical departments of Jinah Hospital, Lahore as a consequence of the unfortunate incident of Idara Minhaj-ul-Quran, be summoned from M.S. Jinah Hospital, Lahore through the Secretary Health, Government of the Punjab, Lahore.

Statements of two doctors namely Dr. Sajjad Karamat, DMLO (IW-6) and Dr. Anwaar Mumtaz, DMLO Forensic Medicine Service, Services Hospital, Lahore (IW-7) have been recorded.

The proceedings are adjourned for tomorrow (02.07.2014) at 2:00 pm.

(ALI BAQAR NAJAFI) TRIBUNAL 2.07.2014

Barrister Qasim Ali Chowhan, AAG. Mr. Aftab Ahmed Bajwa, Advocate.

Ms. Shabnam Aslam Nagi, Advocate.

Dr. Abdur Rauf, M.S. Jinnah Hospital, Lahore.

Mr. Abdullah Malik, President Civil Society Network.

Dr. Ghulam Ghazi, Demonstrator, Jinnah Hospital, Lahore.

Dr. Iftikhar Ahemd Zahid, Demonstrator, Jinnah Hospital, Lahore

Today doctors who conducted the autopsies of ten (10) dead bodies completed their statements, whereas they also recorded their statements in respect of injured police personnel/official and tendered the medico legal certificates.

- 2. According to the Medical Superintendent, Jinnah Hospital, Lahore injured persons namely, Waqas, Meraj Din, Haroon and Arslan, are in the hospital and getting their necessary treatment but are stable and according to him they are in a position to record their statements. Since these injured persons may have been the eye witnesses of the occurrence, therefore, they may be summoned to record their statements before this Tribunal on 04.07.2014. The C.C.P.O. and M.S. Jinnah Hospital, Lahore will make all necessary arrangements to produce them before this Tribunal.
- 3. During the proceedings some valuable suggestions were also made which have been noted down and will enlighten this Tribunal which will help at the time of giving its report.
- 4. On the applications filed by Mr. Aftab Ahmed Bajwa, Advocate let a notice be issued to Advocate General, Punjab.

The proceedings are adjourned for tomorrow (03.07.2014) at 2:00 P.M. The Inspector General of Police, Punjab is directed to submit his regular/interim report tomorrow.

(ALI BAQAR NAJAFI)
TRIBUNAL

03.07.2014 Mr. Muhammad Hanif Khatana, Additional Advocate General Puniab.

Mr. Qasim Ali Chohan, AAG.

Rana Ijaz Ahmad Khan, Advocate

Mr. Sarfraz Hussain, Advocate

Ms. Shabnam Aslam Nagi, Advocate.

Mr. Altaf Hussain, Additional Inspector General of Police, Punjab

Rana Muhammad Latif, DSP, Legal.

Mr. Saif ul Murtaza, DSP/Member Joint Investigation Team.

Mr. Karamat Ali, DSP, Legal.

Mr. Abdullah Malik, President Civil Society Network.

At the very outset with a view to interrupt the proceedings a captious application was filed by Rana Ijaz Ahmad Khan, Advocate which is not even worth reading; the contents of which are not only devoid of any force but are also tainted with mala-fides and ulterior motives to protect the vested interest. This application is straightway dismissed with an observation that such like efforts will neither be considered nor even entertained.

- 2. In today's proceedings some valuable suggestions were made by Mr. Abdullah Malik, President Civil Society Network and Mrs. Shabnam Aslam Nagi, Advocate, Mr. Sarfraz Hussain, Advocate and others which have been properly noted down and the Tribunal may make use of them if need be.
- 3. Copies of the applications filed by Mr. Aftab Ahmad Bajwa, Advocate have been handed over to Mr. Muhammad Hanif Khatana, Additional Advocate General, Punjab who was asked to assist this Tribunal on the next date of hearing i.e 09.07.2014.
- 4. The interim report filed by the Joint Investigation Team has been submitted which has been made part of the record. The Additional Inspector General of Police, Punjab, has also submitted his regular/interim report who has been directed to specify actions taken against the police officials regarding their roles in the unfortunate incident who are facing inquiries either departmentally or otherwise. According to the CCPO, Lahore the report has been submitted stating that eleven injured persons have been served and who have not appeared before this Tribunal.
- 5. Let a notice be repeated to them under the provisions of CPC for the next date of hearing i.e. 09.07.2014 for recording of their evidence.

6. The proceedings are adjourned for tomorrow (04.07.2014) at 2:00 pm when four injured persons presently under treatment in Jinnah Hospital will be examined. The Medical Superintendent of Jinnah, Hospital, Lahore as well as C.C.P.O, Lahore both have already been directed on 2.07.2014 in this behalf.

(ALI BAQAR NAJAFI) TRIBUNAL **04.07.2014** Mr. Qasim Ali Chohan, AAG.

Mr. Altaf Hussain, Additional Inspector General of Police, Punjab

Mr. Karamat Ali, SP, Legal.

Dr. Abdur Rauf, Medical Superintendent, Jinah Hospital,

Lahore.

The injured persons have been served as per report submitted by the C.C.P.O, Lahore. The Medical Superintendent Jinnah Hospital, Lahore has submitted his report stating that according to the opinion of the concerned doctors who are treating the injured patients, namely, Waqas son of Niamat Masih aged 19 years, Miraj Din son of Jan Muhammad aged 16 years, Arsalan Anjum son of Ghulam Rasool aged 22 years and Haroon Khalid son of Khalid aged 26 years, their movements outside the hospital can be dangerous.

- 2. Since according to the medical expert opinion the said four injured persons cannot appear before the Tribunal, therefore, the learned D&SJ, Lahore is appointed as a Local Commissioner under section 4(d) of The (Punjab) Tribunals of Inquiry Ordinance, 1969 to record their bedside statements and present the recorded statements alongwith his report before this Tribunal on 14.07.2014. Meanwhile, the M.S. Jinah Hospital, Lahore will cooperate with the learned D&SJ, Lahore/ Commission for the above-said purpose.
- 3. The Addl. IGP, has submitted the interim report on the fact finding inquiry, according to which the inquiry is underway. He is enquired as to how long will it take to proceed against the responsible officials/ officers, he seeks time to give a report subsequently. He is directed to submit it on 09.07.2014.
- 4. The regular interim report has been submitted by Addl. IGP, which is made part of the record.
- 5. Meanwhile, Mst. Naghmana Yasmeen daughter of Mirza Mahr Din has submitted a sworn affidavit claiming herself to be the eye witness of the occurrence, in which two women were

gunned down. Her affidavit is made part of the record. She may be called upon for further questioning.

6. The proceedings are adjourned to 09.07.2014 at 2:00 pm.

09.07.2014 Mr. Muhammad Hanif Khatana, Additional Advocate General Punjab.

Mr. Qasim Ali Chohan, AAG.

Ms. Shabnam Aslam Nagi, Advocate.

Mr. Altaf Hussain, Additional Inspector General of Police, Punjab

Mr. Saif ul Murtaza, DSP/Member Joint Investigation Team.

Mr. Karamat Ali, SP, Legal.

Mr. Abdullah Malik, President Civil Society Network.

Mr. Aftab Ahmad Bajwa, Advocate.

Mr. Shafqat Chohan, President Lahore High Court Bar

Association.

Amjad Ali No. 2070-C injured person.

Karmat Ali SP Investigation has submitted a report regarding the service of summons on the injured persons. One Amjad Ali son of Ameen a police constable No.2070 is present before this Tribunal today. He has submitted an affidavit, which has been made part of the record. The other injured persons who were not personally served shall be served personally, and through their newly pointed out addresses for the next date of hearing.

- 2. Altaf Hussain, Addl. IGP has submitted a report stating that so far nothing was done adverse to the police officials who conducted the operation against Idara Minhaj-ul-Quran. This report has also been made part of the record.
- 3. Saif-ul-Murtaza, DSP Legal/Member J.I.T. has also submitted a report today, which has been made part of the record.
- 4. In the applications submitted by Mr. Aftab Ahmad Bajwa, Advocate, the prayers were made regarding the issuance of certified copies of certain documents which are being submitted before this Tribunal as annexed to the reports. He has also requested to provide other necessary informations i.e. Cell Phone data, Modern Devices and wireless log book to him. But, Mr. Mohammad Hanif Khatana, Addl. Advocate General has submitted that the applicant has no locus standi as his client is

not an eye witness of the occurrence and that the applications are not maintainable particularly in view of the fact that constitution of Tribunal was challenged by him in the Writ Petition which is pending before Single Bench of Lahore High Court, Lahore. He further submits that the Tribunal can summon any witness or document in order to find out the facts and circumstances and also can accept affidavits. However, he has objected to the reports being requisitioned from J.I.T. regularly.

- 5. Undoubtedly, to ascertaining the facts and circumstances of the unfortunate incident of Model Town is within the scope of this Tribunal. At present, at least one inquiry at the departmental level and the investigation are being conducted in the FIR No.510 of 2014 dated 17.06.2014 registered with Police Station Faisal Town, Lahore by the Joint Investigation Team, which is an independent Agency. This Tribunal is not exercising any supervisory role, but keeping itself abreast of any unearth fact by J.I.T. in order to give its report within its terms of reference.
- 6. Through the applications submitted by Mr. Aftab Ahmad Bajwa, Advocate, certain documents have been pointed out which may be helpful to reach a definite report by the Tribunal. In this view of the matter, the Inspector General of Police is directed to provide the information of SOPs for communication of the orders by him to the police officials on the ground during an operation such like the one under probe. Meanwhile J.I.T is directed to submit the technical evidence/information i.e. Call DATA Reports, transcripts of phonetic information between 16.06.2014 to 17.06.2014 between the Chief Minister, Rana Sanaullah, former Law Minister, Dr. Togeer Hussain Shah, the former Secretary to the Chief Minister, and (1) the Home Secretary Government of Punjab, (2) the Commissioner Lahore Division, (3) CCPO, Lahore, (4) DCO Lahore, (5) Rana Abdul Jabbar DIG Operations, Lahore, (6) Tariq Aziz SP Operation Model Town, (7) Mahroof Safdar

Wahla SP Head Quarter, Lahore, (8) Malik Awais SP Operations Saddar, (9) Umar Virk SP Operations Iqbal Town, (10) Farrukh Raza SP Operations Iqbal Town, Lahore, (11) Mohammad Nadeem SP Investigation Model Town, Lahore, (12) Agha Mohammad Ramzan SP Flying Squad, (13) Abdul Rehman Sherazi SP Mujahid Squad and (14) Salman Khan SP Security.

- 7. It is also deemed appropriate that in order to further probe into the matter and to ascertain true facts and circumstances a report be requisitioned from the SP Special Branch, which shall include the videos of the incident collected by it. A report be also requisitioned from the Director I.B. to know their view point regarding the incident to ascertain the facts and circumstances which will also include their technical assistance. Likewise, this Tribunal also feels it appropriate to summon a report from the concerned Director of ISI of the incident together with the necessary technical evidence/information. The said reports shall reach this Tribunal on 14.07.2014.
- 8. The applications suggesting different points by Mr. Abdullah Malik, President Civil Society Network have been made part of the record and will provide an input at the relevant time during the proceedings Mr. Shafqat Chohan, President Lahore High Court Bar Association has volunteered to participate in the proceedings and has also stated that the Executive Committee has constituted a Legal Team for assistance.
- 9. The proceedings are adjourned for 14.07.2014 at 2:00 p.m.

14.07.2014 Mr. Tariq Iftikhar, District & Sessions Judge, Lahore,

Mr. Altaf Hussain, Additional Inspector General of Police, Punjab, Lahore,

Mr. Saif ul Murtaza, DSP/Member Joint Investigation Team.

Mr. Asad Ali Khan, Deputy Director, ISI,

Mr. Muhammad Waqar Abbasi, SSP, Special Branch, Lahore,

Mr. Masroor Alam, Director, IB, Admen and Mr. Sajid Bilal, Director, IB, Lahore.

Since the lawyers are observing strike, therefore, Chamber proceedings are being conducted today. The Commission/District & Sessions Judge, Lahore has placed on record a report alongwith statements of four injured persons which has been made part of the record. Mr. Altaf Hussain, SP, Legal has placed on record a report of SOPs which has been made part of the record. Mr. Saif-ul-Murtaza, DSP/Member Joint Investigation Team has placed on record progress report of the JIT containing details of the Cell Phone numbers under use of 18 persons alongwith CDs which is also hereby made part of the record. However, he undertakes to place on record the remaining cell phone numbers under use of the persons required by this Court when ever made available to him. Mr. Muhammad Wagar Abbasi, SSP, Special Branch, Lahore has submitted a report containing two CDs which have been made part of the record. Mr. Alam, Director IB, Admin and Mr. Sajid Bilal, Director IB, Lahore have appeared and placed on record a report of the incident which has been made part of the record. Mr. Asad Deputy Director, ISI appeared on behalf of the Director, who stated that latter is not in the City in pursuance to his professional obligations. He has placed on record a report and two CDs of incident which has been made part of the record. He is also delivered a list of cell phone numbers under use of 18 persons for the purpose of analysis. Meanwhile, necessary data of 16th and 17th of June, 2014 in respect of the said 18 telephone numbers shall be requisitioned from the relevant cell phone companies so as to reach this Tribunal by 16^{th} of July, 2014 at 2.00 p.m. Necessary letters shall be issued immediately.

7. The proceedings are adjourned for 16.07.2014 at 2:00 p.m.

16.07.2014 Ms. Shabnam Aslam Nagi, Advocate.

Mr. Altaf Hussain, Additional Inspector General of Police, Punjab

Mr. Saif ul Murtaza, DSP/Member Joint Investigation Team.

Mr. Abdullah Malik, President Civil Society Network.

Mr. Aftab Ahmad Bajıva, Advocate with Qamar Sohail.

Mr. Asad Ali Khan, Deputy Director, ISI.

Syed Arslan Bokhari, Representative of U-fone.

Mr. Attiq Hussain Shah, Representative of Mobilink.

Mr. Shahid Naseem Advocate with Mukhtar Ahmad s/o

M. Hussain eye witness.

Mr. Mushtaq Ahmad Mohal, Advocate with Imran Hussain.

Mr. Atiq Hussin Shah Representative of Mobilink has submitted the cell phone data of Cell phone number sent to them along with soft copy which have been made part of the record. Syed Arslan Bokhari Representative of U-fone has also placed on record Cell Phone data which have also been made part of the record. An E-mail sent to this Tribunal by M/s Warid Telecom has been made part of the record. The received cell phone data has been handed over to Mr. Asad Ali Khan, Deputy Director I.S.I for analysis the report of which will be submitted on the next date.

- 2. An application is submitted by Mukhtar Ahmad through Mr. Shahid Naseem Gondal, Advocate, praying to restrict the publication of remarks by the Tribunal as it may influence the proceedings of J.I.T.
- 3. This application appears to be a misconceived one as the Tribunal is exercising maximum restraint in its remarks and therefore, is issuing interim orders for the information to the media and for General Public. It needs to be observed that the vibrant and independent media is an asset of our country and we as a nation are proud of it, therefore have full confidence in it. This application is, therefore, dismissed.
- 4. Mr. Mukhtar Amad son of Mohammad Hussain has placed on record an affidavit being an eye witness of the occurrence which is made part of the record.

- 5. Through the application under section 5 of the Punjab Tribunal of Inquiry Ordinance, submitted by Imran Hussain through Mr. Mushtaq Ahmad Mohal, Advocate has prayed for collection of the Cell Phone data of two sons of Dr. Tahir ul Qadri, namely, Hassan Mahyoudin and Hussain Mahyoudin to ascertain the whole truth.
- 6. This Tribunal has already issued various notices to Idara Minhaj-ul-Quran for their valuable participation and for recording of evidence of the eye witnesses of the unfortunate incident but so far they have not directly given their input. The option of collecting of their Cell Phone DATA may be exercised subsequently, if need be. Imran Hussain has also submitted an affidavit which has been made part of the record.
- 7. The application filed by Sohail Qamar through Mr. Aftab Ahmad Bajwa, Advocate will be taken up on Friday.
- 8. Mr. Abdullah Malik, President Civil Society Network has moved an application to collect the video recording of the J.I.T. If need be at the relevant time this recording may be summoned. Through an other application the telephonic conversation record of one to one chat between the Chief Minister and his Principle Secretary and other police/Civil Officers is requested to be summoned from ISI and MI. This application has been made part of the record and an appropriate order may be passed subsequently, if need be.
- 9. Through this application Mr. Abdullah Malik, President Civil Society Network has informed the Tribunal that his car was stolen upon which FIR No.117 of 2014 has been registered at Police Station Civil Lines, Lahore, which is an effort to harass and pressurize him not to participate in the Tribunal. Copy of this application has been handed over to Mr. Altaf Hussain, Addl. Inspector General of Police Punjab, Lahore who is directed to submit a report on the next date of hearing.

- 10. Through a suggestion Mrs. Shabnam Aslam Nagi, Advocate has requested for summoning of the different officers present at the spot, which may be taken into account by this Tribunal at the relevant time, if need be.
- 11. Mr. Saif-ul-Murtaza, DSP, Legal/Member J.I.T. seeks more time to place on record the remaining cell phone numbers.
- 12. The proceedings are adjourned for 18.07.2014 at 2:00 p.m.

18.07.2014 Ms. Shabnam Aslam Nagi, Advocate.

Mr. Altaf Hussain, Additional I.G of Police, Punjab

Mr. Saif ul Murtaza, DSP/Member Joint Investigation Team.

Mr. Abdullah Malik, President Civil Society Network.

Mr. Aftab Ahmad Bajwa, Advocate with Qamar Sohail.

Mr. Asad Ali Khan, Deputy Director, ISI.

Mr. Shahid Naseem Advocate with Khawaja Sohail Maqbool son of Maqbool Ahmad and Waqas Ahmad s/o Gulzar Ahmad eye witness.

Mr. Mushtaq Ahmad Mohal, Advocate.

Mr. Karamat Ali, SP Legal with injured persons.

Mr. Asad Ali Khan, Deputy Director ISI has placed on record interim report of the analysis of 17 cell phone numbers. He seeks some more time to submit the final report. He may provide the final report on 23rd of July 2014.

- 2. A report has been submitted by Mr. Altaf Hussain, Addl. Inspector General of Police Punjab stating that on the theft of the car of Mr. Abdullah Malik FIR No. 304 of 2014 dated 9th of July 2014 u/s 381 PPC at Police Station Old Anarkali, Lahore was registered thereafter the CCPO, Lahore has been directed to make all efforts to trace out the car. It was also stated that FIR No. 117 of 2014 at Police Station Civil Lines, Lahore was already registered on the complaint of Mr. Abdullah Malik in which two accused persons have been arrested and on police remand. In this view of the matter, the CCPO, Lahore is directed to submit a precise report as to the progress in the above said FIRs on the next date of hearing.
- 3. Mr. Saif-ul-Murtaza DSP/ Member J.I.T. has submitted a report showing 10 cell phone numbers which report has been made part of the record. The relevant Cellular Companies shall be accordingly sent notices to submit their cell phone DATA of the above said ten numbers so as to reach this Tribunal on next date of hearing i.e. 21.07.2014.
- 4. Khawja Sohail Maqbool s/o Maqbool Ahmad r/o Flat No.229-D LDA Flat Lahore and Waqas Ahmad son of Gulzar Ahmad r/o H. No.118-E, Model Town, Lahore through Mr. Shahid Naseem Tahir Gondal, Advocate have appeared before this Tribunal and have submitted their affidavits alongwith their CNIC, which have been made part of the record. They may be summoned subsequently if so required.

- 5. Meer Kashif Khalil, DSP Garden Town Circle Lahore, Zulfigar Ali Inspector/SHO Police Station Gulberg, Mohammad Ishtiaq Inspector/ SHO P.S. Kahna, Rana Islam DSP/SDPO Ichhra Model Town Division, Lahore, Magsood Ali Inspector/SHO P.S. Qilla Gujar Singh, Mumtaz Hussain SI/SHO P.S. Garden Town, Lahore, Mohammad Ashraf ASI 2145/L, Police Post Lakhoki PS Kahna, Raheel Ahmad 4409-C Police Lines Qilla Gujar Singh, Mohammad Irfan 22239-C Flying Squad, Imdad Ali 20516-C PS Garden Town, Lahore, Ghulam Ali 724-C PS Garden Town, Lahore, Mohamamd Saein 3202-C PS Naseer Abad, Lahore, Aamir Hassan 19956-C, PS Wahdat Colony, Lahore, Mohammad Jameel 10810-C Investigation PS Ghalib Market, Lahore, Irfan Ali 19997-C Elite Force Qurban Line Lahore, Imran Ali 2045-C Permanent attached Elite Force Gujrat have submitted their affidavits accompanied by their MLCs, respectively, which are made part of the record. They may be summoned subsequently for certain questioning, if so required. Mohammad Afzel 20850-C P.S. Lytton Road, Lahore has also appeared before this Tribunal and submitted his affidavit accompanied by his MLC stating that he received bullet shot from behind, same is made part of the record. He may also be summoned subsequently for certain questioning, if need be.
- 6. Mrs. Shabanam Aslam Nagi, Advocate has submitted a CD of different scenes regarding unfortunate incident which has been made part of the record. It will provide further help to this Tribunal for preparation of report.
- 7. Since the Police Department has started submitting the police witnesses who sustained the injuries, therefore, it is appropriate that said higher police officers who were present at the spot in the operation should also appear before this Tribunal to submit their affidavits. Therefore, (1) Rana Abdul Jabbar then DIG Operations, Lahore, (2) Tariq Aziz then SP Operation Model Town, (3) Mahroof Safdar Wahla then SP Head Quarter, Lahore, (4) Malik Awais then SP Operations Saddar, (5) Umar Virk then SP Operations Iqbal Town, (6) Farrukh Raza then SP Operations Iqbal Town, Lahore, (7) Mohammad Nadeem then SP Investigation Model Town, Lahore, (8) Agha Mohammad Ramzan then SP Flying Squad, (9) Abdul Rehman Sherazi then SP Mujahid

Squad and (10) Salman Khan then SP Security should appear before this Tribunal to submit their affidavits on 21.07.2014.

- 8. Mr. Abdullah Malik President Civil Society Network has given suggestions that since a secret meeting was held a day before the incident in which, according to him, the plan was prepared, therefore, its participants be also summoned. The Tribunal has noted the suggestion with due consideration.
- 9. The proceedings are adjourned for 21.07.2014 at 2:00 p.m.

Ms. Shabnam Aslam Nagi, Advocate.

Mr. Altaf Hussain, Additional I.G of Police, Punjab

Mr. Saif ul Murtaza, DSP/Member Joint Investigation Team.

Mr. Abdullah Malik, President Civil Society Network.

Mr. Aftab Ahmad Bajwa, Advocate with Qamar Sohail.

Mr. Asad Ali Khan, Deputy Director, ISI.

Mr. Mushtaqe Mohal, Advocate with Shafique Ahmad s/o Ali Mohammad eye witness.

Mr. Shahid Naseem Gondal, Advocate with Khizar Ameen s/o M.Ameen and Mohammad Javed s/o Mohammad Sharif eye witness.

Mr. Intizar Hussain, Advocate with Ajmal s/o Ghulam Sarwar eye witness.

Mr. Karamat Ali, SP Legal in person.

(1) Rana Abdul Jabbar former DIG Operations, Lahore, (2) Mahroof Safdar Wahla then SP Head Quarter, Lahore, (3) Malik Awais then SP Operations Saddar, (4) Umar Virk then SP CIA/Organized Crime, (5) Dr. Farrukh Raza former Addl. SP Operations Allma Iqbal Town, Lahore, (6) Mohammad Nadeem then SP Investigation Model Town, Lahore, (7) Agha Mohammad Ramzan then SP VVIP Security Lahore, (8) Abdul Raheem Sherazi then SP Mobile, Lahore and (9) Salman Ali Khan former SP Security (10) Mr. Tariq Aziz, Former SP Model Town, Lahore.

Mr. M. Mazhar Hashmi, Representative of Mobilink.

Mr. Sajjad Ali, Representative of Warid.

Syed Arslan Bokhari, Representative of U-fone.

Ch. Waheed Iqbal, Advocate Representative of PTCL.

The report has been submitted on behalf of the CCPO, Lahore stating that Investigation of the stolen vehicle has been entrusted to new Investigating Officer. In this view of the matter, the SP Investigation will appear personally before this Tribunal on next date of hearing.

- 2. Mohammad Mazhar Hashmi, Representative of Mobilink has submitted Cell phone DATA of five cell phone numbers, which is made part of the record. Syed Arslan Bokhari Representative of U-fone has placed on record Cell Phone DATA of two cell phone numbers, which is made part of the record. Sajjad Ali Representative of Warid has submitted Cell Phone DATA of five cell phone numbers, which has been made part of the record. Ch. Waheed Iqbal, Advocate has submitted Cell Phone DATA of six PTCL Numbers which has been made part of the record. The soft copies of Cell Phone DATA i.e. Mobilink, U-fone and Warid have been provided to Mr. Asad Ali Khan, Deputy Director ISI for his analysis and report by 23.04.2014. The Cell Phone DATA has not been provided by M/s Zong Cellular Company. Let a notice be given to the said Cellular Company for providing the Cell Phone DATA on 23.07.2014, which they can collect from Registrar of this Tribunal.
- 3. (1) Rana Abdul Jabbar former DIG Operations, Lahore, (2) Mahroof Safdar Wahla then SP Head Quarter, Lahore, (3) Malik Awais then SP

Operations Saddar, (4) Umar Virk then SP CIA/Organized Crime, (5) Dr. Farrukh Raza former Addl. SP Operations Allma Iqbal Town, Lahore, (6) Mohammad Nadeem then SP Investigation Model Town, Lahore, (7) Agha Mohammad Ramzan then SP VVIP Security Lahore, (8) Abdul Raheem Sherazi then SP Mobilink, Lahore and (9) Salman Ali Khan former SP Security, Lahore have submitted their sworn affidavits, which have been made part of the record, they will be summoned subsequently, for certain questioning if need be. Whereas (10) Mr. Tariq Aziz former SP Model Town, Lahore has also submitted his MLC alongwith his affidavit, which has been made part of the record and he will be summoned for further questioning if need be.

- 4. Shafique Ahmad son of Ali Ahmad has submitted an affidavit attached to the application through Mr. Mushtaq Ahmad Mohal, Advocate which is made part of the record. Khizar Ameen son Muhammad Amin and Muhammad Javed son of Muhammad Sharif through Mr. Shahid Naseem Gondal, Advocate have also submitted their affidavits attached to the applications which are made part of the record. Ajmal son of Ghulam Sarwar has also submitted his affidavit attached to the application through Mr. Intizar Hussain, Advocate which is made part of the record.
- 5. Mrs. Shabnam Aslam Nagi, Advocate has suggested that the Cell Phone of the responsible officers be properly analyzed and report be submitted. Suffice it to say that the DATA is already under analysis and its report is being presented before this Tribunal. Mr. Abdullah Malik, President Civil Society Network has suggested that in view of the threats advanced to Chairman Pakistan Awami Tahreek, the Government was supposed to provide security to him. He has also placed on record a CD which will help this Tribunal for the purpose of preparation of report.
- 6. We have substantially completed our work, but have not received any assistance by Tahreek Minhaj-ul-Quran. They were time and again issued notices to come forward and give the evidence before this Tribunal. With this background let a final notice for participation be issued to the Minhaj-ul-Quran Secretariat for 25.07.2014 to produce before this Tribunal whatever evidence available with them. Any mode of participation involving modern devices will be available to them. If they are so willing, they may contact the Registrar of this Tribunal before the said date i.e. 25.7.2014.
- 7. Mr. Saif-ul-Murtaza DSP/Member J.I.T, present before this Tribunal, is directed to hand over copy of the application presented by Minhaj-ul-Quran Secretariat as their version of the unfortunate incident on next date of hearing.
- 8. Meanwhile, a report be requisitioned from the Special Branch Punjab, Intelligence Bureau and the ISI regarding any prior information which

they had already provided to Provincial Government immediately before the unfortunate incident, the said report if any shall be submitted before this Tribunal on 23.07.2014.

- 9. This Tribunal deems it expedient to ascertain the facts and circumstances of the incident leading to the change of Inspector General of Police Punjab immediately before the unfortunate incident. Let a report be requisitioned from the Cabinet Secretary Government of the Punjab to inform this Tribunal about the above said circumstances so as to reach this Tribunal by 23^{rd} July 2014.
- 10. The proceedings are adjourned for 23.07.2014 at 11.30 a.m.

Mr. Saif ul Murtaza, DSP/Member Joint Investigation Team.

Mr. Abdullah Malik, President Civil Society Network.

Mr. Asad Ali Khan, Deputy Director, ISI.

Mr. Sajid Bilal-ul-Rehman, Director Intelligence Bureau.

Mr. Jabran Munir Awan, Advocate representative of Zong

Mr. Muhammad Hanif Khatana, Addl: A.G.

Mr. Altaf Hussain, Addl. Inspector General of Police Punjab.

Mr. Karmaat Ali, SP Legal.

Mr. Jibran Munir Awan, Advocate Representative of Zong Cellular Company has submitted that the cell phone number referred for the DATA has already been transferred to Mobilink on 9.05.2012, therefore, the said data be made available from the said Company. In this view of the matter, let notice be issued to Mobilink Cellular Company for the submission of the cell phone DATA today which shall be sent to Mr. Asad Ali Khan, Deputy Director ISI for its analysis and report for 25.07.2014.

- 2. Mr. Saif-ul-Murtaza DSP Legal/Member JIT has place on record photo copy of the application which Mr. Mohammad Jawad, Director Administration Minhaj-ul-Quran International Secretary presented to SHO Police Station Faisal Town, Lahore dated 19th June, 2014 for registration of FIR which is hereby made part of the record. Mr. Saif-ul-Murtaza DSP has also placed on record a CD of the telephone numbers under the use of concerned persons which has been made pat of the record. The numbers shall be immediately referred to respective cellular companies for providing DATA so that it may be transmitted to Deputy Director ISI for analysis, if already not presented. Mr. Saif-ul-Murtaza has also placed on record report of the Special Branch dated 11th June, 2014 and 14th June 2014 regarding the return of Mr. Tahir-ul-Qadri to Pakistan and the same is made part of the record.
- 3. Mr. Sajid Bilal-ul-Rehman, Director Intelligence Bureau has submitted report that no intelligence information was provided to Provincial Government immediately before the incident.
- 4. Mr. Asad Ali Khan, Deputy Director ISI has categorically stated that no report either was demanded from the Agency nor it was presented to Provincial Government immediately before the incident. He

has also placed on record the analysis report regarding cell phone numbers sent to him, which is made part of the record.

- 5. Mr. Mohamad Hanif Khatana, learned Addl. A.G. has brought into the notice of this Tribunal that Secretary Establishment Government of Pakistan is the concerned person instead of Cabinet Secretary Government of the Punjab. As such to ascertain the facts and circumstances of the incident leading to the change of Inspector General of Police Punjab immediately before the unfortunate incident, let a report be requisitioned from the Secretary Establishment Government of Pakistan in this regard, so as to reach this Tribunal by 25th July 2014.
- 6. All the Police Officials who presented their affidavits before this Tribunal are re-summoned for 24th July 2014 for their cross examination at 11:30 a.m.
- 7. Mian Dawood Representative of Value TV a Lahore based channel has presented CD regarding the unfortunate incident, which has been made part of the record.
- 8. The proceedings are adjourned for 24.07.2014 at 11.30 a.m.

Mr. Saif ul Murtaza, DSP/Member Joint Investigation Team.

Mrs. Shabnam Aslam Nagi, Advocate.

Mr. Abdullah Malik, President Civil Society Network.

Mr. Altaf Hussain, Addl. Inspector General of Police Punjab.

Mr. Karmaat Ali, SP Legal.

Mr. Aftab Ahmad Bajwa, Advocate.

Mr. Qasim Ali Chohan, Asst. Advocate General.

Rana Abdul Jabbar former DIG Operations, Lahore, Mahroof Safdar Wahla then SP Head Quarter, Lahore, Malik Awais then SP Operations Saddar, Umar Virk then SP CIA/Organized Crime, Dr. Farrukh Raza former Addl. SP Operations Allma Iqbal Town, Lahore, Mohammad Nadeem then SP Investigation Model Town, Lahore, Abdul Raheem Sherazi then SP Mobile, Lahore, Salman Ali Khan former SP Security, Lahore and. Tariq Aziz former SP Model Town, Lahore in person.

Today the cross examination of Rana Abdul Jabbar former DIG Operations, Lahore, Mahroof Safdar Wahla then SP Head Quarter, Lahore, Malik Awais then SP Operations Saddar, Umar Virk then SP CIA/Organized Crime, Dr. Farrukh Raza former Addl. SP Operations Allma Iqbal Town, Lahore, Mohammad Nadeem then SP Investigation Model Town, Lahore, Abdul Raheem Sherazi then SP Mobile, Lahore, Salman Ali Khan former SP Security, Lahore and. Tariq Aziz former SP Model Town, Lahore have been recorded. Let the remaining injured police officials appear tomorrow at 11:30 a.m.

- 2. The Convener Joint Investigation Team has moved an application to provide written statements of the injured persons admitted in the Jinah Hospital, Lahore in connection with FIR No.510/2014, registered at P.S. Faisal Town, Lahore. As the statements of the injured IWs have been recorded by the Commission appointed by this Tribunal, therefore, their statements be provided to the convener JIT.
- 3. It is appropriate that for cross examination Rana Sanaullah the former Law Minister as well as Dr. Toqeer Shah former Principle Secretary to Chief Minister be summoned for 25.07.2014.
- 4. This Tribunal, at this stage and before conclusion of the Inquiry, deems it appropriate that in order to ascertain the facts and circumstances of the incident Minhaj-ul-Quran dated 17.6.2014 an

affidavit be submitted by the Chief Minister Punjab, Mian Muhammad Shahbaz Sharif, through his authorized agent so as to reach this Tribunal on 25.07.2014.

5. The proceedings are adjourned for 25.07.2014 at 11:30 a.m.

Mr. Saif ul Murtaza, DSP/Member Joint Investigation Team.

Mrs. Shabnam Aslam Nagi, Advocate.

Mr. Abdullah Malik, President Civil Society Network.

Mr. Altaf Hussain, Addl. Inspector General of Police Punjab.

Mr. Aftab Ahmad Bajwa, Advocate.

Mr. Asad Ali Khan, Deputy Director ISI.

Mr. Mohammad Hanif Khatana, Addl. Advocate General. Rana Sanaullah former Law Minister, Dr. Toqeer Shah former Secretary to Chief Minister, Meer Kashif Khalil DSP, Zulfiqar Ali Inspector/SHO PS Gulberg, Mohammad Ishtiaq Inspector/SHO PS Kahna, Rana Mohammad Islam DSP/SDPO Ichhra Model Town Division, Mohammad Sharif ASI 2145-L Police Post Lakhoki PS Kahna, Raheel Ahmad constable No.4409, Mohammad Saien constable No. 3202, Amir Hassan No.19956-C and Mian Javed Iqbal son of Mian Ahmad eye witness.

Mr. Nadeem Hassan Asif, Secretary Establishment Government of Pakistan has sent a report narrating the facts and circumstances which prompted the Federal Government to transfer I.G.P. Punjab. The same has been made part of the record.

- 2. Mr. Asad Ali Khan, Deputy Director ISI has also placed on record analysis report of the eight Cell Phone Numbers which has been made part of the record. He is directed to submit the final report by tomorrow.
- 3. Cross Examination on Rana Sanaullah, former Law Minister, Dr. Toqeer Shah, former Secretary to Chief Minister, Meer Kashif Khalil DSP, Zulfiqar Ali Inspector/SHO PS Gulberg, Mohammad Ishtiaq Inspector/SHO PS Kahna, Rana Mohammad Islam DSP/SDPO Ichhra Model Town Division, Mohammad Sharif ASI 2145-L Police Post Lakhoki PS Kahna, Raheel Ahmad constable No.4409, Mohammad Saien constable No.3202, Amir Hassan No.19956-C and evidence of Mian Javed Iqbal son of Mian Ahmad eye witness of the incident and resident of the area have been recorded today.
- 4. The Advocate General Punjab has requested for a short time to comply with the order passed by this Tribunal whereby the Chief Minister Punjab was directed to submit his affidavit through an authorized agent, which is allowed. The said affidavit can now be submitted by tomorrow at 11:30 a.m.

- 5. Mr. Abdullah Malik, President Civil Society Network has reported that he has been threatened from unknown numbers. Let the Inspector General Police Punjab appear in person to brief about his security.
- 5. The proceedings are adjourned for 26.07.2014 at 11:30 a.m.

Mr. Mohammad Hanif Khatana, Addl. Advocate General with Mushtaq Ahmad Sukhera, IGP, Punjab and Abdul Qayyum, special Secretary to the Chief Minister Punjab.

Mrs. Shabnam Aslam Nagi, Advocate.

Mr. Abdullah Malik, President Civil Society Network.

Mr. Altaf Hussain, Addl. Inspector General of Police Punjab.

Mr. Asad Ali Khan, Deputy Director ISI.

Mr. Sultan Mahmood, Advocate.

Mr. Asad Ali Khan, Deputy Director ISI has placed on record the analysis report except for the Cell Phone Numbers issued by the Warid Telecom Com. Company, who incorrectly send the cell phone data of 16th and 17 of July, 2014 instead of 16th and 17th of June, 2014. Let a notice be issued to the Warid Telecom Company to immediately send the cell phone data of the said numbers of the required date so as to reach this Tribunal today.

- 2. Mr. Muhammad Hanif Khatana, Advocate General Punjab has submitted the affidavit of the Chief Minister Punjab, Mian Muhammad Shahbaz Sharif, through his authorized agent, Abdul Qayyum, Special Secretary, Chief Minister Office, which affidavit has been read in the open Court/Tribunal by the learned Advocate General. This affidavit has, therefore, been made part of the record.
- 3. Mr. Mushtaq Ahmad Sukhera, Inspector General of Police, Punjab has submitted that requisite security has been provided to Mr. Abdullah Malik, President Civil Society Network. He further assures the expeditious and transparent investigation of the FIR in which the theft of the vehicle belonging to Abdullah Malik was reported.
- 4. The Tribunal has concluded its proceedings and the finding would be properly conveyed.

09.08.2014 Present:

Today, the requisite report has been compiled. Let it be submitted to the competent Authority for further action under the law at their end.